

**Julie James AS/MS**  
Y Gweinidog Newid Hinsawdd  
Minister for Climate Change



Llywodraeth Cymru  
Welsh Government

Ein cyf/Our ref: MA-JJ-0994-23

Llŷr Gruffydd MS  
Chair  
Climate Change, Environment and Infrastructure Committee  
Senedd Cymru  
Cardiff Bay  
CF99 1SN

12 June 2023

Dear Llŷr

Following the introduction of the Infrastructure (Wales) Bill into the Senedd on 12 June, please find attached a copy of the Regulatory Impact Assessment (RIA) Methodology Paper. This document is provided to support the Committee's scrutiny of the Bill. It supplements the RIA by providing the detailed workings behind the costs for the various options outlined for determining infrastructure development applications in the future, as contained in Chapters 7 and 8 of the assessment.

I look forward to providing evidence to the Committee in due course.

I am copying this letter to the Chair of the Legislation, Justice and Constitution Committee and to the Chair of the Finance Committee.

Yours sincerely

**Julie James AS/MS**  
Y Gweinidog Newid Hinsawdd  
Minister for Climate Change

Canolfan Cyswllt Cyntaf / First Point of Contact Centre:  
0300 0604400

Bae Caerdydd • Cardiff Bay  
Caerdydd • Cardiff  
CF99 1SN

[Gohebiaeth.Julie.James@llyw.cymru](mailto:Gohebiaeth.Julie.James@llyw.cymru)  
[Correspondence.Julie.James@gov.Wales](mailto:Correspondence.Julie.James@gov.Wales)

Rydym yn croesawu derbyn gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg. Byddwn yn ateb gohebiaeth a dderbynnir yn Gymraeg yn Gymraeg ac ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

We welcome receiving correspondence in Welsh. Any correspondence received in Welsh will be answered in Welsh and corresponding in Welsh will not lead to a delay in responding.



Llywodraeth Cymru  
Welsh Government

# **INFRASTRUCTURE (WALES) BILL**

Regulatory Impact Assessment  
Methodology Paper

**June 2023**

# Contents

List of Abbreviations	1
Section 1 - Introduction	2
Section 2 - Principles of Approach	3
Section 3 - Detailed Approaches and Assumptions	5
Detailed Approaches and Assumptions - Option 1 - Do nothing. Applications for infrastructure to be determined according to the current legislative arrangements	8
Detailed Approaches and Assumptions - Option 2 - Establish a new form of 'Welsh Infrastructure Consent' for development or works with the objective of constructing and/or changing use to create a 'Welsh Infrastructure Project'. This is the preferred option	25
Detailed Approaches and Assumptions - Option 3 - Establish an independent consenting body to determine 'Welsh Infrastructure Consents'	42
Detailed Approaches and Assumptions - Option 4 - Establish fast-track and consistent infrastructure consenting regimes to be determined by a unit within the Welsh Government	57
Annex A - Breakdown of PEDW and the Welsh Government's costs for determining infrastructure applications	61
Annex B - Applications submitted during the assessed period April 2013 to April 2022	71

## **List of Abbreviations**

DCO – Development Consent Order

DNS – Development(s) of National Significance

IC – Infrastructure Consent

LPA – Local Planning Authorities

NRW – Natural Resources Wales

PEDW – Planning and Environment Decisions Wales

SIP – Significant Infrastructure Project

TCPA – Town and Country Planning Act 1990

## **Section 1 - Introduction**

- 1.1 This Methodology Paper supplements the Regulatory Impact Assessment (“RIA”) for the Infrastructure (Wales) Bill. It provides detail on the workings behind the costs for the various options outlined for the determining of infrastructure development applications in future, as contained in Chapters 7 and 8 of the assessment.
- 1.2 The format of this Methodology Paper firstly sets out at Section 2 the key principles used for the calculating of costs contained in the assessment. Section 3 sets out the base data, assumptions and calculations used to inform the costs outlined under each of the options in the assessment.
- 1.3 The following sections provide further detail and explanation for the sections as outlined above and for the specific options set out in the RIA where further detail is required. Numbers have been rounded to the nearest £100 in the RIA but have not been rounded in this paper.

## Section 2 – Principles of Approach

2.1 Some key principles have informed the costs set out in the assessment, as follows:

- Costs are based on a five year appraisal period of the various options, from 2024-2025 to 2028-2029.
- Estimates of costs for the various assessment options are based on evidence collated by Arup Planning Consultations on infrastructure applications submitted to relevant consenting authorities over the period April 2013 to February 2019 (see 'Arup Report' at footnote)<sup>1</sup>. Further evidence on the numbers of infrastructure applications was acquired to supplement the Arup Report from March 2019 to April 2022, ensuring costs are as up-to-date as possible for publication. The entire period for the assessment of infrastructure applications from April 2013 to April 2022 has been termed as the 'assessed period' for the purposes of the RIA.
- Costs from the Arup Report are considered to represent the best available evidence and an accurate representation of costs that would incur today to stakeholders for different types of infrastructure application. It is recognised that variables could result in some costings being slightly higher or lower in subsequent years. However, as they are taken over a broad period, with a number of set costs included such as application fees, it is considered appropriate to apply them in their pure form without adjustments being made.
- Costs to stakeholders for involvement in the determination of infrastructure applications have been taken primarily from the Arup Report or from desk-based research carried out by Welsh Government officials on PEDW/Welsh Government and LPA costs for involvement in the process.
- Final costings have been rounded to the nearest £100 in the RIA. This ensures clarity and ease of reference when comparing costs. Financial sums have been rounded to the nearest full number (i.e. excluding decimals). As a consequence, there will be a small margin of error as original calculations were made including decimals, to provide accuracy.
- Application numbers have not been rounded in the calculations to ensure more accurate reflection of costs under each option over the longer term. For example, DNS applications per annum have been counted at 6.0 and 4.9, and not rounded to the nearest application.
- Inflation has been applied to the historic costs where applicable, by uprating based on GDP deflator figures dated November 2022. This ensures costs in the assessment are accurate at the time of its publication, as based on 2022/2023 prices. For information, the inflation deflator figures applied for the purposes of the assessment are contained in Table A below.

---

<sup>1</sup> Evidence on infrastructure applications can be found in the report: [Research into the Cost of Infrastructure development in Wales, Arup, March 2019](#).

<b>Table A – Uprating historic costs to 2022-23 prices using GDP deflator series - Using Nov 2022 data<sup>2</sup></b>			
Year	Original series	Index <i>2022-23 = 100</i>	Uprating factor
2011-12	82.35	78.53	1.273
2012-13	83.77	79.89	1.252
2013-14	85.51	81.55	1.226
2014-15	86.46	82.45	1.213
2015-16	87.14	83.11	1.203
2016-17	88.93	84.81	1.179
2017-18	90.42	86.23	1.160
2018-19	92.03	87.77	1.139
2019-20	94.42	90.05	1.111
2020-21	100.48	95.82	1.044
2021-22	100.00	95.37	1.049

This table shows the calculations used to apply historic costs from a particular financial year to 2022-23 prices. As a theoretical example, where a cost of £1,000 has been taken from 2016-17, that cost would be uprated to £1,179 in 2022-23 prices (£1,000\*1.179).

---

<sup>2</sup> Inflation deflator figures based on UK Government data located at the following web address: [https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\\_data/file/1118718/GDP\\_Deflators\\_Autumn\\_Statement\\_November\\_2022\\_update.xlsx](https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/1118718/GDP_Deflators_Autumn_Statement_November_2022_update.xlsx)

## **Section 3 - Detailed Approaches and Assumptions**

- 3.1 Detail on the approaches and assumptions for specific topic-based issues and / or each of the policy options contained in the assessment is provided below. Detail on particular costings is provided where there is a clear need to provide supplementary information or evidence on how figures have been derived. Where the assessment is clear on how figures have been derived and evidenced, this information is not repeated in this methodology paper.

### **Detailed Approaches and Assumptions – Specific Topic Based Issues**

- 3.2 Certain approaches and assumptions have been made in respect of various topic based areas to inform the costs evidenced in the assessment. These are as follows:

#### ***Grading of infrastructure applications for assessment***

- 3.3 It is recognised that those infrastructure applications evidenced for the purposes of the assessment differ in scale, size and complexity, and are therefore examined differently. For example, smaller solar energy schemes captured would have been determined by the way of written representations, whilst more complex and larger generating schemes, such as a tidal lagoon, are likely to have been determined by inquiry. This would result in differing costs for determining those applications and these differences in costs must be factored into the assessment.
- 3.4 To provide an indicative range of costs for those infrastructure applications evidenced, applications have been divided into three levels based on their likely complexity. Projects such as small scale renewable energy facilities which have or are anticipated to be examined by written representations have been categorised as 'low complexity'. Larger facilities which have or are anticipated to be examined by topic-specific hearings have been categorised as 'medium complexity'. Large scale projects with a range of issues that have or are expected to be examined by inquiry have been categorised as 'high complexity'.

#### ***LPA costs for participating in the determination of infrastructure applications***

- 3.5 Costs to LPAs for participating in the determination of infrastructure applications have been based on costs provided by 10 LPAs over the period May to November 2022 for their involvement in recent DNS applications. These costs are provided below:

<b>Table B – LPA Costs for Involvement in DNS Applications</b>	
LPA	Estimated cost to LPA per application
LPA 1	£20,200 (A)
LPA 2	£3,475 (B)
LPA 3	£2,725 (C)
LPA 4	£2,250 (D)
LPA 5	£1,250 (E)
LPA 6	£0 (F)
LPA 7	£0 (G)
LPA 8	Estimated costs for involvement in 4 DNS applications at: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• £6,763 (H);</li> <li>• £1,250 (I);</li> <li>• £0 (J); and</li> <li>• £2,823 (K).</li> </ul>
LPA 9	£15,737.53 (L)
LPA 10	£0 (M)
<b>Average (used for purposes of RIA)</b>	<b>(A + B + C + D + E + F + G + H + I + J + K + L + M) / 13 = £4,344 per application.</b>

- 3.6 The above data was informed by a request to LPAs from the Welsh Government where LPAs were asked to provide costs for participation in recent DNS applications, based upon their costs for making representations, preparing and submitting a Local Impact Report and participating in any examination process (hearing or inquiry).
- 3.7 Returns were provided by LPAs in respect of 13 applications taken through the entire DNS determination process. Due to the nature of the data held in respect of their involvement, for the majority of cases LPAs provided a figure for their total involvement in the DNS application based upon staff costs (i.e. wages and time accrued). Authorities have been anonymised to ensure costs cannot be attributed to particular applications, to ensure no release of sensitive information.
- 3.8 Costs varied considerably for involvement between different types of DNS application and therefore an average figure of £4,344 per application has been applied for the purposes of assessment. Costs for LPA preparation of a Local Impact Report per application have been discounted from the above totals, counted separately as a £7,750 reimbursed cost by the Welsh Government. Some authorities confirmed they only received half the Welsh Government's amount for reimbursement of LIR at £3,875 due to late submissions of those documents. Where this is the case, the figure of half the reimbursement for LIR has instead been discounted, rather than the £7,750 full fee.
- 3.9 Some authority costs for participation in DNS applications are showing as zero. This is the case where reimbursed totals for LIR cover the costs for participation the LPA has provided.
- 3.10 It should be recognised that the above figures provided by LPAs may not include all costs for DNS participation as it is difficult to provide exact figures on outgoings such as office administration. Also, in some cases, developers may have reimbursed fees to authorities through Planning Performance Agreements, but for other DNS applications such agreements did not apply. Therefore, there is not a consistent basis to apply those other

detailed costs and it is therefore considered the above figures represent best estimates of LPA costs for DNS participation to apply for the purposes of assessment.

### ***PEDW and the Welsh Government's costs for determining infrastructure applications***

- 3.11 Based on experience of working on DNS applications, officials from Welsh Government's Planning Directorate and PEDW undertook a desktop exercise to determine the range of costs for determining different complexities of infrastructure applications. These costs are based on the tasks undertaken, staff time and staff salary for determining DNS applications and have informed the Welsh Government / PEDW costs evidenced in the assessment. A full breakdown of those costs are provided at **Annex A**.

### ***Statutory Consultees***

- 3.12 Costs to statutory consultees are taken from data provided by the Arup Report on infrastructure applications up to 2019. It is considered that data is robust to inform estimates of statutory consultee costs under the various options, with the nature of how statutory consultees respond to infrastructure applications not considered to have changed from 2019 up to publication of the assessment.
- 3.13 Numbers of statutory consultee responses have been based on responses to DNS applications assessed from the Arup study findings at 1.6 per application. This number is considered to be reflective of statutory consultees likely to respond to infrastructure applications in general, including those that may be submitted under different regimes.
- 3.14 For a very small number of infrastructure applications during the assessed period, Marine Licences would be required under the Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009, which NRW determine under current regimes. Costs for NRW determination of marine licences under current regimes have therefore been included in this paper. Those costs are not included under Options 2 and 3 as under those options NRW would not be responsible for determining marine licences which would be subsumed into the IC process. However they would retain a participatory role in marine licencing under all options.
- 3.15 The cost for interacting with various consenting processes in respect of marine licencing has been provided by NRW<sup>3</sup>. This has been aggregated across four different regimes for a cross-section of infrastructure applications. These costs have been considered, and the cost of interacting with, for example, the Planning Act 2008 or the Transport and Works Act 1992, is likely to be the same as interacting with the IC process. These costs are funded through grant in aid, and are likely to be the same across Options 1-4 and consequently, are not included in the RIA.

### ***Welsh Government's role in infrastructure applications***

- 3.16 For some infrastructure schemes, the Welsh Government acts as the developer and so is the applicant behind applications for consent. The costs associated with this role are included within the 'developer' sections of the assessment.
- 3.17 For some infrastructure schemes, the Welsh Government is consulted as a statutory consultee and so is responsible for providing a substantive consultation response. The costs associated with this role are included within 'stakeholder' sections of the assessment.

---

<sup>3</sup> Costs for NRW involvement in marine licencing were provided to the Welsh Government on the 10 February 2023.

## **Detailed Approaches and Assumptions – Option 1 – Do nothing. Applications for infrastructure to be determined according to the current legislative arrangements**

### ***Option 1 – General Principles***

3.18 During the assessed period, applications have been made for infrastructure projects set out at Annex 3 of the RIA under the following regimes:

- Planning permission under section 57 of the TCPA 1990 (including those determined via ‘call-in’ or appeal);
- Development Consent Orders under section 31 of the Planning Act 2008<sup>4</sup>;
- DNS consent under section 62D of the TCPA;
- Consent to construct and operate generating stations under section 36 of the Electricity Act 1989;
- Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under the Harbours Act 1964;
- Orders under the Transport and Works Act 1992; and
- Orders under the Highways Act 1980.

3.19 Based on findings over the assessed period from April 2013 to April 2022, 54 infrastructure applications were found to have been submitted, working out at (54 / 9) six applications per year. These have been broken down by the regime they would be determined under and likely level of complexity. A detailed breakdown is provided in the table below:

---

<sup>4</sup> Applications have been evidenced under this regime because, due to changes in thresholds for determination, they would be determined by the Welsh Ministers under the DNS regime in future.

<b>Table C – Infrastructure applications submitted over assessed period April 2013 to April 2022, applied retrospectively to inform costs for Option 1 (Do Nothing)</b>	
Regime	Numbers
Planning permission under s.57(1) TCPA 1990 <sup>5</sup>	6
Developments of National Significance ('DNS') under s.62(D) TCPA 1990	22
Orders under s.10, s.14, s.16, s.28 Highways Act 1980	10
Development Consent Orders ('DCOs') under s.31 Planning Act 2008 <sup>6</sup>	8
Generating stations under s.36 Electricity Act 1989 <sup>7</sup>	2
Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders (HRO) under s.14 of the Harbours Act 1964	5
Orders under s.1 and s.3 of the Transport and Works Act 1992	1
<b>Total</b>	<b>54</b>

3.20 It is noted that from 1 April 2019, the Welsh Ministers were devolved further consenting powers as a consequence of the commencement of provisions set out in the Wales Act 2017. This includes the further devolution of the consenting of generating stations up to 350MW (from 50MW) with no upper limit for onshore wind generating stations, and of Harbour Revision Orders. Prior to this transfer of competence, certain

<sup>5</sup> Under current arrangements, due to updates to legislation, those applications recorded under this regime would be determined as Developments of National Significance going forwards and costs have therefore been calculated on that basis. The Arup dataset includes 11 s.57 apps. Two were duplicates of one particular scheme and so merged as one. Three were of too small a MW size (under 10MW) and so were not included.

<sup>6</sup> See previous footnote. In addition, 1 of the 8 DCOs would be determined as an application under the Electricity Act under current arrangements, therefore this application is costed as such rather than as a Development of National Significance.

<sup>7</sup> 1 of the 2 Electricity Act applications would be determined as a DNS under current arrangements, therefore costed as such for the purposes of the RIA.

consents were issued under the Planning Act 2008 by the Secretary of State (namely generating stations between 50MW and 350MW). However, following this devolution, applicants for devolved projects are no longer able to access the process under the Planning Act 2008, and consenting for equivalent projects is given either under the sections 57 or 62D of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (onshore) or section 36 of the Electricity Act 1989. Furthermore, the assessed period has quantified applications prior to the coming into force of the DNS process on 1 March 2016, which largely comprise of generating stations with an installed generating capacity of between 10MW and 50MW. Such applications were made to Local Planning Authorities. Were such an application made in the current legislative framework, they would be subject to the DNS process.

- 3.21 For the purposes of the RIA and this methodology paper, and to accurately reflect a 'do nothing' option, applications are counted as if they were submitted under the current legislative regime. For example, the Swansea Bay Tidal Lagoon was a Development Consent Order issued under the Planning Act 2008, as it was applied for and consented prior to 1 April 2019. If an application was made for the same development today, it would be determined under section 36 of the Electricity Act 1989, and this is reflected in the RIA. The table at **Annex B** reflects which developments were submitted during the assessed period, which regime they fell under for their determination, and which regime they would be determined under following the current legislative regimes.

<b>Table D – Numbers and graded complexity of anticipated infrastructure applications per annum under Option 1</b>	
Projects (over nine year assessed period)	Projects per year
6 high complexity – Developments of National Significance	$(6 / 9) = 0.7$
10 high complexity – Highways Act 1980	$(10 / 9) = 1.1$
1 high complexity – Transport and Works Act 1992	$(1 / 9) = 0.1$
2 high complexity – Electricity Act 1989	$(2 / 9) = 0.2$
<b>19 Total High Complexity Projects</b>	<b><math>(19 / 9) = 2.1</math></b>
21 medium complexity – Developments of National Significance	$(21 / 9) = 2.3$
5 medium complexity – Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders	$(5 / 9) = 0.6$
<b>26 Total Medium Complexity Projects</b>	<b><math>(26 / 9) = 2.9</math></b>
9 low complexity – Developments of National Significance	$(9 / 9) = 1$
<b>9 Total Low Complexity Projects</b>	<b><math>(9 / 9) = 1</math></b>
<b>Total 54 Assessed Projects</b>	<b><math>(54 / 9) = 6.0</math></b>

**Option 1 – Welsh Government costs**

3.22 A detailed breakdown of costs per year to the Welsh Government under this option for continuing with current infrastructure consenting regimes is provided in the table below:

<b>Table E – Breakdown of costs per annum to the Welsh Government for continuing with current consenting regimes under Option 1</b>	
Regime	Cost
Planning permission under section 57(1) of the TCPA	£0 (A.).
Developments of National Significance (DNS) permission under s.62D of the TCPA 1990	<p>36 DNS in total over the nine year assessed period. Of these it is estimated they are made up of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 9 low complexity = <math>9 / 9 = 1</math> per annum (B.).</li> <li>• 21 medium complexity = <math>21 / 9 = 2.3</math> per annum (C.).</li> <li>• 6 high complexity = <math>6 / 9 = 0.7</math> per annum (D.).</li> </ul> <p>Average cost to PEDW / the Welsh Government for different complexities of DNS application:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Low complexity = £32,154 (E.).</li> <li>• Medium complexity = £76,084 (F.).</li> <li>• High complexity = £208,146 (G.).</li> </ul> <p>Total cost per annum = <math>(B. \times E.) + (C. \times F.) + (D. \times G.) = £348,448</math> (H.). This cost is considered to be reimbursed by developers.</p>
Consent to construct and operate generating stations under section 36 of the Electricity Act 1989	<p>2 generating stations under the Electricity Act over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of generating stations per annum = <math>2 / 9 = 0.2</math> (I.).</p> <p>Assumed that generating stations would be the equivalent to determining a high complexity DNS application at £208,146 (J.).</p>

	Total cost per annum = (I. x J.) = £46,255. (K.). This cost is considered to be reimbursed by developers.			
Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under the Harbours Act 1964	<p>5 Harbour Orders over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of Harbour Order applications per annum = <math>5 / 9 = 0.6</math> (L.).</p> <p>Assumed that Harbour Orders would be the equivalent to determining a medium complexity DNS application at £76,084 (M.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = (L. x M.) = £42,269. (N.). This cost is not considered to be reimbursed by developers.</p>			
Orders under the Transport and Works Act 1992	<p>1 Transport and Works Order over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of anticipated Transport and Works Order applications per annum = <math>1 / 9 = 0.1</math> (O.).</p> <p>Assumed that Transport and Works Orders would be the equivalent to determining a high complexity DNS application at £208,146 (P.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = (O. x P.) = £23,127. (Q.). This cost is not considered to be reimbursed by developers:</p>			
Orders under the Highways Act 1980	<p>10 Highways Orders over the nine year assessed period. Number of anticipated Highways Order applications per annum = <math>10 / 9 = 1.1</math> (R.).</p> <p>Estimated that costs of determining a highway order are made up of the following tasks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cost to PEDW for producing an Inspector's Report assumed to be the equivalent for a high complexity DNS application = £208,146 (S.).</li> <li>• Reviewing the report, briefing the Minister and publishing the decision (based on information provided by Transport Division of Welsh Government, responsible for determining orders under the Highways Act) = £24,036 (T.).</li> </ul> <table border="1" data-bbox="824 1265 1337 1375"> <tr> <td>Review of Inspectors Report</td> <td>£13,409</td> </tr> </table>		Review of Inspectors Report	£13,409
Review of Inspectors Report	£13,409			

	MA and associated documents	£7,156	
	Clearances	£2,283	
	Publication	£1,189	
	TOTAL	£24,036	
Total cost for determining a highway order = (S. + T.) = £232,182 (U.).			
Total cost per annum = (R. x U.) = £257,980. (V). This cost is considered to be reimbursed by developers.			
<b>Total cost to the Welsh Government per annum for continuing with current consenting regimes under Option 1</b>	(sum (A.), (H.), (K.), (N.), (Q.), (V.)) = <b>£718,078 per annum.</b>		
	<i>(H.) + (K.) + (V.) = £652,682 reimbursed.</i>		
	<i>(N.) + (Q.) = £65,396 not reimbursed.</i>		

3.23 Costs to the Welsh Government for continuing with current consenting regimes under this option are based on the following assumptions, which are reflected in the current regimes column at **Annex B**:

- There were six applications for planning permission under section 57(1) of the TCPA 1990 over the assessed period with a generating capacity of over 10MW. Under the current legislative framework, the six applications would be determined under section 62D of the TCPA as DNS. Therefore, they would not generate appeal costs to the Welsh Government and it is not considered necessary to calculate the cost of section 57 appeals under this option.
- The number of 36 DNS applications for 'infrastructure development' over the assessed period<sup>8</sup> is based on 22 applications submitted to or subject to examination by PEDW under that particular regime and that would remain determined as DNS under section 62D of the TCPA. In addition, it includes 14 applications that were submitted under other legislative regimes<sup>9</sup> that would now be determined as DNS applications.

<sup>8</sup> Applications taken from Arup 2019 'Research into the Cost of Infrastructure development in Wales', plus additional applications submitted to PEDW over the period February 2019 to 1 April 2022.

<sup>9</sup> 7 Development Consent Orders ('DCOs') under s.31 Planning Act 2008; 6 for planning permission under s.57(1) TCPA 1990; and 1 for a generating station under s.36 of the Electricity Act 1989.

- Records which The Department for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy (BEIS) hold do not distinguish the nominal voltage of an overhead electric line and whether the project is devolved. These records could therefore not be reliably analysed, thus the number of section 37 applications under the Electricity Act 1989 which would otherwise be DNS under current legislative regimes is considered for the purpose of this study as zero.
- It is only considered costs for DNS, Highways Orders and generating stations would be reimbursed by the Welsh Ministers under this option. Fees for Harbour and Transport and Works Orders are considered to be too low in order for the Welsh Ministers to be able to recover costs for those types of applications from developers.

**Option 1 – Local Planning Authority costs**

3.24 A detailed breakdown of costs per year to local planning authorities under this option for continuing with current infrastructure consenting regimes is provided in the table below:

<b>Table F – Breakdown of costs per annum to local planning authorities for continuing with current consenting regimes under Option 1</b>	
Regime	Cost
Planning permission under section 57(1) of the TCPA	£0 (A.).
Developments of National Significance (DNS) permission under s.62D of the TCPA 1990	<p>36 DNS in total over the nine year assessed period. Number in total per year = <math>36 / 9 = 4</math> (B.).</p> <p>Assumed that cost to LPAs would comprise of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Preparation of Local Impact Report = £7,750 (C.); and</li> <li>Other costs estimated for LPA participation in the DNS process (as evidenced elsewhere in this paper) = £4,344 per application (D.).</li> </ul> <p>Total cost per annum = <math>(B. \times C.) + (B. \times D.) = £48,376</math> (E.).</p>

	<p>Only costs for Local Impact Report reimbursed, therefore non-reimbursed costs = (B. x D.) = £17,376 (F.).</p>
<p>Consent to construct and operate generating stations under section 36 of the Electricity Act 1989</p>	<p>2 generating stations under the Electricity Act over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of generating stations per annum = <math>2 / 9 = 0.2</math> (G.).</p> <p>Assumed that costs to LPAs for their participation in the process for determining generating stations would be similar to their participation in DNS at £4,344 per application (H.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = (G. x H.) = £965 (I.).</p>
<p>Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under the Harbours Act 1964</p>	<p>5 Harbour Orders over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of Harbour Order applications per annum = <math>5 / 9 = 0.6</math> (J.).</p> <p>Assumed that costs to LPAs for their participation in the process for determining Harbour Orders would be similar to their participation in DNS at £4,344 per application (K.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = (J. x K.) = £2,413 (L.).</p>

<p>Orders under the Transport and Works Act 1992</p>	<p>1 Transport and Works Order over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of anticipated Transport and Works Order applications per annum = <math>1 / 9 = 0.1</math> (M.).</p> <p>Assumed that costs to LPAs for their participation in the process for determining Transport and Works Orders would be similar to their participation in DNS at £4,344 per application (N.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = <math>(M. \times N.) = £483</math> (O.).</p>
<p>Orders under the Highways Act 1980</p>	<p>10 Highways Orders over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of anticipated Highways Order applications per annum = <math>10 / 9 = 1.1</math> (P.).</p> <p>Assumed that costs to LPAs for their participation in the process for determining Highways Orders would be similar to their participation in DNS at £4,344 per application (Q.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = <math>(P. \times Q.) = £4,827</math> (R.).</p>
<p><b>Total cost to local planning authorities per annum for continuing with current consenting regimes under Option 1</b></p>	<p><math>(\text{sum (A.), (E.), (I.), (L.), (O.), (R.)}) = \mathbf{£57,064 \text{ per annum (S.)}</math>.</p> <p><i>Of that cost (B. x C.) = £31,000 reimbursed (T.).</i></p> <p><b><i>Remaining (S. – T.) = £26,064 not reimbursed.</i></b></p>

3.25 Costs to local planning authorities for continuing with current consenting regimes under this option are based on the following assumptions:

- For some infrastructure schemes, LPAs act as the developer and so is the applicant behind applications for consent. The costs associated with this role are included within the ‘developer’ sections of the assessment.
- For some infrastructure schemes, LPAs are consulted as a statutory consultee and so are responsible for providing a substantive consultation response. The costs associated with this role are included within ‘stakeholder’ sections of the assessment.
- Similar assumptions in respect of the relevant consenting regime under the current legislative framework as detailed in Paragraph 3.22 above have been made.
- With regards to Harbour Orders, Transport and Works Orders and Highways Orders, detailed information on costs to LPAs for their participation in the determination of those types of applications was not available. It is therefore considered appropriate to assumed

costs for their participation would broadly align with costs obtained for their participation in other types of infrastructure application determined under the DNS route, at a cost to LPAs of £4,344 per application. This assumption has been applied in the calculations.

**Option 1 – Development Industry costs**

3.26 A detailed breakdown of costs per annum to the development industry under this option for continuing with current infrastructure consenting regimes is provided in the table below:

<b>Table G – Breakdown of costs per annum to the development industry for continuing with current consenting regimes under Option 1</b>	
<b>Regime</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Planning permission under section 57(1) of the TCPA	£0 (A.).
Developments of National Significance (DNS) permission under s.62D of the TCPA 1990	<p>36 DNS in total over the nine year assessed period. Number in total per year = <math>36 / 9 = 4</math> (B.).</p> <p>Developer costs of £897,230 (C.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = <math>(B. \times C.) = £3,588,920</math> (D.).</p>
Consent to construct and operate generating stations under section 36 of the Electricity Act 1989	<p>2 generating stations under the Electricity Act over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of generating stations per annum = <math>2 / 9 = 0.2</math> (E.).</p> <p>Arup Report estimated average costs to developers for applications for generating stations per application = £1,586,503 (F.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = <math>(E. \times F.) = £352,556</math> (G.).</p>

<p>Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under the Harbours Act 1964</p>	<p>5 Harbour Orders over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of Harbour Order applications per annum = <math>5 / 9 = 0.6</math> (H.).</p> <p>Arup Report estimated average costs to developers for Harbour Orders per application = £429,689 (I.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = <math>(H. \times I.) = £238,716</math> (J.).</p>
<p>Orders under the Transport and Works Act 1992</p>	<p>1 Transport and Works Order over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of anticipated Transport and Works Order applications per annum = <math>1 / 9 = 0.1</math> (K.).</p> <p>Arup Report estimated average costs to developers for Transport and Works Orders per application = £3,156,913 (L.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = <math>(K. \times L.) = £350,768</math> (M.).</p>
<p>Orders under the Highways Act 1980</p>	<p>10 Highways Orders over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of anticipated Highways Order applications per annum = <math>10 / 9 = 1.1</math> (N.).</p> <p>Estimated costs for a developer submitting a Highways Order application (based on Welsh Government determination costs) = £232,182 (O.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = <math>(N. \times O.) = £257,980</math> (P.).</p>
<p><b>Total cost to the development industry per annum for continuing with current consenting regimes under Option 1</b></p>	<p><b>(sum (A.), (D.), (G.), (J.), (M.), (P.)) = £4,788,940 per annum.</b></p>

3.27 Costs to the development industry for continuing with current consenting regimes under this option are based on the following assumptions:

- Similar assumptions in respect of the relevant consenting regime under the current legislative framework as detailed in Paragraph 3.22 above have been made.
- For developer DNS costs, the figure of £897,230 is taken from the Arup Report, based on average general and specific procedural costs per application associated with securing consent. The Arup Report confirms this figure includes planning application fees.
- It is optional for a developer to submit applications for secondary consent alongside an application for DNS, and the number of secondary consents relevant to an application for DNS will vary. There are no existing trends and it is not possible to accurately predict any additional costs associated with secondary consents. These costs are therefore unknown.
- Developers are not able to appeal PEDW decisions on DNS applications. Therefore, there are no appeal costs to developers associated with this type of application.
- For the other types of consent that are listed, applications must be accompanied by the appropriate fee. These fees are variable and considered to represent a small fraction of the preparation costs to developers per application. For the purposes of consistency in applying data from the Arup Report under Option 1 for the different types of infrastructure application, it is considered fee amounts for other consents would be absorbed as part of the overall costs listed in the Arup Report (excluding Highways Orders, see below).
- With regards to the use of data from the Arup Report on preparation costs for Transport and Works Act 1992 Orders, whilst only English Orders were found as part of the Arup study findings, it is considered those application costs represent a suitable baseline to measure future application costs to developers for Transport and Works Orders submitted in Wales. This is because they will be applications of a similar nature and therefore developers for schemes in Wales are expected to incur similar costs for their submission.
- With regards to Highways Orders, the Arup Report provides Highways Order costs for three significant highways schemes over the period 2013-2019, with preparation costs averaging £15,882,750 per scheme. Following the Welsh Ministers 14 February 2023 announcement regarding The Roads Review and National Transport Delivery Plan<sup>10</sup>, it is considered highways schemes of the nature identified by the Arup Report are unlikely to be representative of the scale and type likely to come forward in Wales in future. It is therefore considered developer costs for preparation of Highway Orders provided by the Arup Report are not representative of the likely costs for schemes that would come forward under the various options and cannot be applied for the purposes of this assessment. As previously evidenced, the Welsh Government's Planning Directorate has acquired estimated costs for the Welsh Government determining Highways Orders (at £232,182 on average per application). Those costs are fully recoverable from developers and can therefore be applied for the purposes of developer costs for Highways Orders under the current consenting arrangements at Options 1. To ensure consistency in applying costs across all options, only determination costs have been applied to developer costs for highways schemes for Options 2, 3 and 4 (see further sections below). By applying determination costs only, it is recognised developer costs for future highways schemes may be higher than evidenced across all options, but it ensures reliable data is applied consistently and therefore provides a suitable comparison of costs for the purposes of this assessment.

---

<sup>10</sup> Oral Statement: The Roads Review and National Transport Delivery Plan, 14 February 2023: <https://www.gov.wales/oral-statement-roads-review-and-national-transport-delivery-plan>

**Option 1 – Statutory Consultees costs**

3.28 A detailed breakdown of costs per annum to statutory consultees under this option for continuing with current infrastructure consenting regimes is provided in the table below:

<b>Table H – Breakdown of costs per annum to statutory consultees for continuing with current consenting regimes under Option 1</b>	
Regime	Cost
Planning permission under section 57(1) of the TCPA	£0 (A.).
Developments of National Significance (DNS) permission under s.62D of the TCPA 1990	<p>Arup Report identified 5 DNS applications with a total of 8 statutory consultee responses. Therefore average of <math>(8/5) = 1.6</math> statutory consultee responses per application (B.).</p> <p>Arup Report estimated costs to statutory consultees ranging from £2,125 to £6,100 per DNS application = median cost of £4,113 per application (C.).</p> <p>Average cost per application = <math>(B. \times C.) = £6,580</math> (D.).</p> <p>Assuming on average of <math>(36/9) = 4</math> DNS applications per annum (E.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = <math>(D. \times E.) = £26,320</math> (F.).</p>
Consent to construct and operate generating stations under section 36 of the Electricity Act 1989	<p>Considered reasonable to assume that for generating stations there would be a comparable number of statutory consultees providing responses in line with the figures for DNS applications = 1.6 statutory consultee responses per application (G.).</p> <p>Arup Report estimated costs to statutory consultees ranging from £297 to £700 per generating station application = median cost of £499 per application (H.).</p>

	<p>Average cost per application = (G. x H.) = £798 (I.).</p> <p>2 generating stations applications over the nine year assessed period. Number of anticipated generating stations applications per annum = <math>2 / 9 = 0.2</math> (J.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = (I. x J.) = £177 (K.).</p>
Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under the Harbours Act 1964	<p>Considered reasonable to assume that for Harbour Orders there would be a comparable number of statutory consultees providing responses in line with the figures for DNS applications = 1.6 statutory consultee responses per application (L.).</p> <p>Arup Report estimated costs to statutory consultees ranging from £700 to £25,438 per Harbour Order = median cost of £13,069 per application (M.).</p> <p>Average cost per application = (L. x M.) = £20,910 (N.).</p> <p>5 Harbour Orders over the nine year assessed period. Number of anticipated Harbour Orders per annum = <math>5 / 9 = 0.6</math> (O.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = (N. x O.) = £11,617 (P.).</p>
Orders under the Transport and Works Act 1992	<p>Considered reasonable to assume that for Transport and Works Orders there would be a comparable number of statutory consultees providing responses in line with the figures for DNS applications = 1.6 statutory consultee responses per application (Q.).</p> <p>Arup Report estimated costs to statutory consultees ranging from £400 to £3,295 per Transport and Works Order = median cost of £1,848 per application (R.).</p> <p>Average cost per application = (Q. x R.) = £2,956 (S.).</p>

	<p>1 Transport and Works Orders over the nine year assessed period. Number of anticipated Transport and Works Orders per annum = <math>1 / 9 = 0.1</math> (T.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = (S. x T.) = £328 (U.).</p>
Orders under the Highways Act 1980	<p>Considered reasonable to assume that for Highways Orders there would be a comparable number of statutory consultees providing responses in line with the figures for DNS applications = 1.6 statutory consultee responses per application (V.).</p> <p>Arup Report estimated costs to statutory consultees = £900 per application (based on only available figures provided for Cadw responding) (W.).</p> <p>Average cost per application = (V. x W.) = £1,440 (X.).</p> <p>10 Highways Orders over the nine year assessed period. Number of anticipated Highways Order applications per annum = <math>10 / 9 = 1.1</math> (Y.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = (X. x Y.) = £1,600 (Z.).</p>
Marine Licence under the Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009	<p>The function for determining marine licences is currently delegated to Natural Resources Wales (NRW).</p> <p>Costs to NRW for determining marine licences, are on average, across a cross-section of infrastructure cases £100,890 per application. £90,620 of that cost is recovered by way of fees. This results in an average cost to NRW per application = £10,270 (AA.)</p> <p>Of the list of developments submitted during the nine year assessed period, four are noted to have required a marine licence. Those are Swansea Bay Tidal Lagoon, Morlais,</p>

	Erebus and Holyhead Marina. Therefore, total number of anticipated marine licence applications per annum = $4 / 9 = 0.44$ (AB.).
	Total cost per annum = (AA. x AB.) = £4,564 (AC.).
<b>Total cost to statutory consultees per annum for continuing with current consenting regimes under Option 1</b>	<b>(sum (A.), (F.), (K.), (P.), (U.), (Z.), (AC.)) = £44,607 per annum.</b>

3.29 Costs to statutory consultees for continuing with current consenting regimes under this option are based on the following assumptions:

- Similar assumptions in respect of the relevant consenting regime under the current legislative framework as detailed in Paragraph 3.22 above have been made.
- For Harbour Revision or Empowerment Orders, Transport and Works Act 1992 Orders and Highways Orders, there was no data available to view on average numbers of statutory consultees responding to such applications from the Arup Report. It is considered reasonable to assume this number would be comparable to the numbers of statutory consultees responding to DNS applications at 1.6 per application as they are similar types of application to DNS in being for infrastructure related schemes.
- For marine licences, it is to be recognised the statutory consultee costs provided relate to NRW's delegated responsibility for their determination. Costs are based upon information provided by NRW on the 10 February 2023 on marine licencing determination costs for infrastructure cases, taking those applications that would apply for the assessed period up to 1 April 2022.

**Detailed Approaches and Assumptions – Option 2 – Establish a new form of ‘Welsh Infrastructure Consent’ for development or works with the objective of constructing and/or changing use to create a ‘Welsh Infrastructure Project’. This is the preferred option**

***Option 2 – General Principles***

- 3.30 Under this option, as outlined in the assessment, there would be the one consenting regime for determining infrastructure schemes. Compared to Option 1, where projects are determined under a number of different regimes, this option would provide a streamlined process.
- 3.31 Based on findings over the nine year assessed period from April 2013 to April 2022, 44 infrastructure applications would form part of a new IC regime under this option. The number of 44 infrastructure applications for a new regime is lower than the 54 applications identified for Option 1 due to the assumptions that:
- the five applications for orders under the Highway Act 1980 for the M4 motorway corridor around Newport would be merged into one IC submission;
  - the three Swansea Bay Tidal apps (1 DCO and 2 Harbour Revision Order applications) would be merged into one IC submission; and
  - the DNS applications for the Sudbrook - gas-fired peaking plant; Valero - Cogeneration Facility; Coed Darcy - energy generation operating reserve compound; and Felindre Road - stand-by energy generating station; would fall within the ‘optional’ Infrastructure Consent bracket. Given the scale and impacts of these proposals, these would likely be made to the Local Planning Authority under section 57 of the TCPA rather than via an Infrastructure Consent. Other applications falling within the optional bracket have been considered of a sufficient scale for developers to likely exercise the option of seeking an Infrastructure Consent.
- 3.32 44 applications works out at (44 / 9) 4.9 applications per annum submitted that would fall under the new IC regime. Therefore, applied retrospectively, costs for this option are based on a calculation of 4.9 infrastructure applications per annum being submitted under the new IC regime going forwards, broken down by likely level of complexity. A detailed breakdown is provided in the table below:

<b>Table I – Numbers and graded complexity of anticipated infrastructure applications per annum for Option 2 under a new IC regime</b>	
Projects (over nine year assessed period)	Projects per year
15 high complexity	$(15 / 9) = 1.7$
24 medium complexity	$(24 / 9) = 2.7$
5 low complexity	$(5 / 9) = 0.6$
<b>Total 44 projects under a new IC regime</b>	<b><math>(44 / 9) = 4.9</math></b>

3.33 It is also noted the four applications over the assessed period mentioned above (Sudbrook etc.) to be determined under section 57 of the TCPA as they are too small to be considered as ICs, would result in those applications being determined as additional applications by LPAs. Applied retrospectively, this would result in  $(4 / 9)$  0.4 infrastructure applications being determined by LPAs rather than the Welsh Ministers under a new IC regime.

***Option 2 – Welsh Government costs for managing of a new IC regime***

3.34 Overall costs to the Welsh Government for the managing of a new IC regime are estimated to be (A. + B. + C.) **£385,308** for set-up costs, with ongoing costs of **£567,664** per annum for the processing and determination of applications. There are various tasks associated with the set-up of a new IC regime, as follows:

- Set-up of new case management and IT systems = £330,000 (A.).
- Training and dissemination = £43,005 (B.).
- Guidance = £12,303 (C.).

3.35 A detailed explanation of the costs associated with each of the above is provided in the sections that follow.

*Option 2 – Welsh Government costs – Set-up of new case management and IT systems*

3.36 The cost for the set-up of new case management and IT systems under Option 2 is assumed to be comparable to the recent transfer of the former Planning Inspectorate Wales (including incorporation of its staff and case management system) into the Welsh Government as PEDW. This assumption is made because new systems under Option 2 would again fall under the responsibility of PEDW, who would be responsible for the processing of applications. Therefore, by making this assumption, it is considered costs would be comparable to expenditure on the incorporation of PEDW work into the Welsh Government over an approximate 2-year period up to 2022/2023 at **£330,000**.

*Option 2 – Welsh Government costs – Training and dissemination for a new IC regime*

3.37 Training and dissemination events for a new IC regime are estimated to cost the Welsh Government (A. + B. as below) **£43,005**. A detailed breakdown of those costs by Welsh Government staff grade and task is provided below:

<b>Table J – Welsh Government Training and Dissemination for New IC Regime – Costs to Planning officials for disseminating training</b>			
Task	Grade 7 Cost	SEO Cost	HEO Cost
12 Dissemination Events	£1,918	£1,468	£1,167
Training with PEDW Inspectors and wider staff	£1,183	£905	£0
Presentation materials preparation	£197	£151	£0
<b>Total costs</b>	<b>£6,988 (A.)</b>		

<b>Table K – Welsh Government Training and Dissemination for New IC Regime – Costs for PEDW officials to attend training</b>						
Task	Deputy Director Inspector Cost (x1 attending)	Grade 6 Inspector Costs (x3 attending)	Grade 7 Inspector Costs (x19 attending)	SEO Costs (x2 attending)	HEO Costs (x3 attending)	TS Costs (x2 attending)
Full day training events	£1,639	£4,815	£24,669	£1,810	£2,159	£925
<b>Total dissemination / familiarisation costs</b>		<b>£36,017 (B.)</b>				

3.38 The above costings are based upon the following make up of tasks and assumptions:

- Ten dissemination events for LPAs, each lasting approximately 3 hours;
- Two dissemination events for the development industry, each lasting approximately 3 hours;
- Three full days training for PEDW Inspectors and wider staff;
- No costs for venue as training will be carried out by Planning Directorate officials of the Welsh Government in existing Government meeting rooms or it will be undertaken virtually;
- Half a day for preparing materials;
- Delivery by 1 Grade 7 and 1 SEO planning official of the Welsh Government, with additional support provided at the dissemination events by 1 HEO planning official;
- Attendance at the three days training by all PEDW staff that would be involved in a new IC regime (information provided by PEDW on the 9 March 2023); and
- Staff costs are based on Welsh Government annual gross salary costs for 2022/2023 broken down by daily and hourly rate, at 220 working days per year (260 weekdays per year minus 40 days for leave and allowance for holidays) and 7.4 hours per day.

3.39 The rationale for the training and dissemination events under this option is to follow a similar format to what took place when the DNS regime was introduced. This format was considered to have worked successfully at the time, and received positive feedback. Following a similar format for a new regime which will again be for the determination of infrastructure applications as with DNS, is considered to be logical and appropriate in this instance.

*Option 2 – Welsh Government costs – Guidance for a new IC regime*

3.40 Standalone guidance for a new IC regime is estimated would cost the Welsh Government **£12,303**. A detailed breakdown of those costs by Welsh Government staff grade and task is provided below:

<b>Table L – Welsh Government Guidance for New IC Regime</b>		
Task	SEO Cost	HEO Cost
Initial preparation of guidance (45 days)	£0	£10,795
Final clearance of guidance (5 days)	£1,508	£0
<b>Total costs</b>	<b>£12,303</b>	

3.41 The above costings are based upon the following make up of tasks and assumptions:

- There will be 15 new guidance documents for a new IC process, this figure has been based on the range of topic areas covered by the legislation for a new regime;
- Delivery by 1 SEO and 1 HEO planning officials of the Welsh Government. HEO responsible for preparation, with each guidance document taking 3 working days to prepare, and SEO clearing contents, with 3 guidance documents being cleared over a working day; and
- Staff costs are based on Welsh Government annual gross salary costs for 2022/2023 broken down by daily rate, at 220 working days per year.

3.42 This cost for standalone guidance would also apply to an independent body for determining IC applications under Option 3 below.

*Option 2 – Welsh Government costs – Processing and determination of applications under a new IC regime*

3.43 Processing of applications for a new IC regime will take place by PEDW on behalf of the Welsh Ministers, with the Welsh Ministers responsible for their final determination. This would result in estimated costs to the Welsh Government of **£567,664 per annum, which would be reimbursed in its entirety**. A detailed breakdown of those costs is provided in the table below:

<b>Table M – Welsh Government costs – Processing and determination of applications under a new IC regime</b>	
Regime	Cost
New IC Regime	<p>Based on findings over the nine year assessed period that 44 applications that would be determined under a new IC process going forward. Of these it is estimated the 44 applications would be made up of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 5 low complexity = 5 / 9 = 0.6 per annum (A.).</li> <li>• 24 medium complexity = 24 / 9 = 2.7 per annum (B.).</li> <li>• 15 high complexity = 15 / 9 = 1.7 per annum (C.).</li> </ul> <p>Average cost to PEDW / the Welsh Government for different complexities of DNS application, used in this case to evidence costs for ICs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Low complexity = £32,154 (D.).</li> <li>• Medium complexity = £76,084 (E.).</li> <li>• High complexity = £208,146 (F.).</li> </ul>
<b>Total costs</b>	<p>Total cost per annum = (A. x D.) + (B. x E.) + (C. x F.) = <b>£567,664 (G.). This cost is considered to be reimbursed by developers.</b></p>

3.44 The above costings are based on the assumption that costs to the Welsh Government for processing and determining applications under a new IC regime would broadly align with costs for the current determination of DNS applications. This is due to it being considered that similar tasks would be involved in both regimes, as they are or would be similarly responsible for the determination of large scale infrastructure projects in Wales.

***Option 2 – LPA costs – Participation in a new IC regime***

3.45 Overall costs to LPAs for participating in a new IC regime are estimated to be **£30,266** for set-up costs, with ongoing costs of **£60,148 per annum, of which £21,237 would not be reimbursed.**

*Option 2 – LPA costs – Set-up costs to attend training and familiarisation events for a new IC regime*

3.46 Set-up costs to LPAs for attending Welsh Government training and familiarisation events for a new IC regime are estimated would cost **£30,266**. A detailed breakdown of these costs by anticipated LPA officers that would attend such events is provided below:

<b>Table N – LPA Costs – Attendance at training and familiarisation events for a new IC regime</b>						
Task	Chief Planner (x1 attending at hourly rate of £51.56)	Development Management Lead (x1 attending at hourly rate of £39.24)	Principal Planning Officer / Team Leader (x2 attending at hourly rate of £30.29)	Senior Planning Officer (x2 attending at hourly rate of £28.69)	Planning Officer (x4 attending at hourly rate of £25)	Chair of Planning Committee (x1 attending at hourly rate of £26.69)
3 hours training per official	£155	£118	£182	£172	£300	£80
Total for 25 LPAs	£3,867	£2,943	£4,544	£4,304	£7,500	£2,002
Apply inflation figure of 1.203 to convert 2015/2016 costs to current prices	£4,652	£3,540	£5,466	£5,177	£9,023	£2,408
<b>Total dissemination / familiarisation costs</b>						<b>£30,266</b>

3.47 The above costings are based upon the following assumptions:

- LPA officers would attend events for a total of 3 hours each;
- Breakdown of officers likely to attend events based on representation across various LPA planning grades, plus allowance for one councillor from each authority with an interest in planning issues. It is recognised composition of staff at individual LPAs will vary, but the make-up of staff identified is considered to represent the maximum number of officers that may attend from any one given LPA; and

- LPA hourly rates are based on information provided in the Planning (Wales) Bill Regulatory Impact Assessment Methodology Paper (dated April 2015)<sup>11</sup>. As those are historic costs, the inflation figure of 1.203 has been applied to convert 2015/2016 costs to current prices.

*Option 2 – LPA costs – Ongoing participation in infrastructure applications with a new IC regime*

3.48 Ongoing involvement in infrastructure applications with a new IC regime are estimated would cost LPAs **£60,148 per annum, of which £21,237 would not be reimbursed**. A detailed breakdown of those costs is provided in the table below:

<b>Table O – LPA Costs Per Annum – Participation in New IC Regime</b>	
Task	Cost
Preparation of Local Impact Report (LIR) IC Regime	£7,750 fee x (44 / 9) 4.9 applications per year = £37,889 (A.). <i>Reimbursed by the Welsh Government</i>
LPA general participation IC Regime	Based on information LPAs have provided for participation in DNS at £4,344 x (44 / 9) 4.9 applications per year = £21,237 (B.). <i>Not reimbursed</i>
LPA determination of infrastructure applications not falling under IC Regime	£2,300 x (4/9) 0.4 applications per year = £1,022 (C.). <i>Reimbursed by fees</i>
<b>Total LPA Costs Per Annum – New IC Regime (Option 2)</b>	(A.) + (B.) + (C.) = <b>£60,148</b> (A.) + (C.) = <b>£38,911 reimbursed.</b> (B.) = <b>£21,237 not reimbursed.</b>

<sup>11</sup> The Planning (Wales) Bill Regulatory Impact Assessment Methodology Paper can be found here: <https://www.gov.wales/planning-wales-bill-regulatory-impact-assessment-methodology-paper>

3.49 The above costings are based upon the following assumptions:

- Costs for preparing LIR are based on current costs per relevant LPA for DNS applications;
- LPA general participation in the regime is based on figures obtained from LPAs for participation in DNS (as covered elsewhere in this paper);
- The cost for LPA determination of infrastructure applications which would not fall under the IC regime is based on LPA fees requirements for similar applications, as taken from the Town and Country Planning (Fees for Applications, Deemed Applications and Site Visits) (Wales) Regulations 2015 (SI 2015/1522), Schedule 1, Part 2: Scale of Fees. Based on those applications found over the assessed period applied retrospectively, it is expected similar applications for LPA determination in future would fall under category 5 of the Fees Schedule: The erection, alteration or replacement of plant or machinery where fees of £460 per 0.1 hectares of the site area apply. The applications evidenced during the assessed period for this purpose are considered to be of low complexity and approximately on average 0.5 hectares in size, resulting in cost per application of (£460 x 5) £2,300; and
- The numbers of applications per year are based on those found over the assessed period, applied retrospectively (as evidenced above).

***Option 2 – Developer costs – Participation in a new IC regime***

3.50 Overall costs to developers for participating in a new IC regime are estimated to be **£3,030** for set-up costs, with ongoing costs at **£4,208,404** per annum.

*Option 2 – Developer costs – Set-up costs to attend training and familiarisation events for a new IC regime*

3.51 Set-up costs to the development industry for attending Welsh Government training and familiarisation events for a new IC regime are estimated would cost **£3,030**. A detailed breakdown of these costs is provided below:

<b>Table P – Developer Costs – Attendance at training and familiarisation events for a new IC regime</b>			
<b>Task</b>	<b>Training time (hours)</b>	<b>Hourly rate</b>	<b>Numbers attending</b>
3 hours training per official	3		
Costs per hour based on disciplinary for "Architectural and engineering activities and related technical consultancy", taken from 2022 ASHE data		£25.25	
Assumed attendance by 20 different bodies at those events (with 2 people from each body attending)			40
<b>Total dissemination / familiarisation costs</b>			<b>£3,030.00</b>

3.52 The above costings are based on the following assumptions:

- Officials from the development industry would attend events for a total of 3 hours each;
- Numbers of officials likely to attend based on engagement undertaken by the Welsh Government’s Planning Directorate with approximately 20 groups/bodies interested in the proposals up to March 2023. It is considered up to 2 individuals from each would attend such events; and
- Developer hourly rates are based upon 2022 Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings (ASHE) data, applying an appropriate discipline for the type of organisations that would attend plus 30% on-costs.

*Option 2 – Developer costs – Ongoing participation in infrastructure applications with a new IC regime*

3.53 Ongoing involvement in infrastructure applications with a new IC regime are estimated would cost the development industry **£4,208,404 per annum**. A detailed breakdown of these costs is provided below:

<b>Table Q – Developer Costs Per Annum – Participation in New IC Regime</b>	
<b>Task</b>	<b>Cost</b>
<p>Developer costs for applications to be determined by the Welsh Ministers under a new IC regime (excluding highways schemes):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Application preparation at £670,000;</li> <li>• Any statutory pre-application consultation at £23,333;</li> <li>• Any non-statutory pre-application consultation (i.e. holding events, publicising events etc. outside of statutory requirements) at £22,500;</li> <li>• Participating in an examination at £116,667;</li> <li>• Making a material amendment to a project during the examination of an application, where one has been made, at £29,667;</li> <li>• Making a non-material or minor amendment to a project during the examination of an application, where one has been made, at £6,250;</li> <li>• Creating and maintaining a website which displays an entire application, for a period of 6 months, at £17,500; and</li> <li>• Publishing a notice in a local newspaper or relevant journal advertising a prospective application for development, for a period of 1 week, at £11,313.</li> </ul> <p>These costs to developers apply for all applications to come forward under a new regime at 44 in total, as evidenced previously, minus 6 applications that would come forward as highways schemes (see row below). Therefore they apply to 38 applications in total over the nine year assessed period.</p>	<p>Total at £897,230 x (38 / 9) 4.2 applications per year = £3,788,304.</p>

<p>Developer costs for highways schemes to be determined by the Welsh Ministers under a new IC regime (6 in total over the nine year assessed period).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Total application costs, excluding preparation costs, at £227,230 (see row above for detailed breakdown).</li> </ul> <p>Plus the following DNS fees:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Notification fee at £580;</li> <li>Initial fee at £15,350;</li> <li>Local Impact Report fee at £7,750; and</li> <li>Determination fee at £14,700.</li> </ul>	<p>Total at £265,610 x (6/9) 0.7 applications per year = £177,073.</p>
<p>Developer costs for infrastructure applications to be determined by LPAs and not under a new IC regime (see further table below)</p>	<p>Total at £546,808 x (4/9) 0.4 applications per year = £243,026.</p>
<p><b>Total Developer Costs Per Annum – New IC Regime (Option 2)</b></p>	<p><b>£4,208,404</b></p>

3.54 The developer costs per infrastructure application for determinations by LPAs under a new IC regime are based on the following calculations:

<b>Table R – Breakdown of developer costs per infrastructure application for LPA determinations, rather than under a new IC regime</b>	
<b>Task</b>	<b>Cost</b>
Application preparation	£670,000
<p>Minus the following DNS fees from total:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Notification fee at £580;</li> <li>Initial fee at £15,350;</li> <li>Local Impact Report fee at £7,750; and</li> <li>Determination fee at £14,700.</li> </ul>	– £38,380

<p>(£580 + £15,350 + £7,750 + £14,700) = £38,380 to be subtracted.</p>	
<p>Minus DNS Examination Fee</p> <p>Examination fees have been calculated on the basis of PEDW Inspectors determining different complexities of DNS application, estimated for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Low complexity DNS at £32,154;</li> <li>• Medium complexity DNS at £76,084; and</li> <li>• High complexity DNS applications at £208,146.</li> </ul> <p>For the assessed period of applications, there were 4 DNS applications per annum, of which 0.7 were of high complexity, 2.3 were of medium complexity and 1 was of low complexity (see figures under Option 1 for do nothing option).</p> <p>Therefore, estimated examination costs per annum for the:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 1 low complexity DNS would be (1 x £32,154) = £32,154;</li> <li>• 2.3 medium complexity DNS would be (2.3 x £76,084) = £177,530; and</li> <li>• 0.7 high complexity DNS would be (0.7 x £208,146) = £138,764.</li> </ul> <p>Total estimated examination costs for the combined 4 DNS per annum would be (£32,154 + £177,530 + £138,764) = £348,448.</p> <p>Therefore, average costs of examination of 1 DNS would be (£394,703 / 4) = £87,112 to be subtracted.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">– £87,112</p>
<p>Add on fee payable by developers to LPAs for LPA determination of infrastructure applications at £2,300 per application, as evidenced in the LPA costs section above.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">+ £2,300</p>
<p><b>Developer costs per infrastructure application for LPA determinations</b></p>	<p style="text-align: right;"><b>£546,808</b></p>

3.55 The above costings are based upon the following assumptions:

- Developer costs are predominantly based on information provided by the Arup Report, using DNS data as comparable costs for those infrastructure applications to be submitted under a new IC regime;
- The numbers of applications per year are based on those found over the assessed period, applied retrospectively (as evidenced above);
- For developer costs for highways schemes under a new IC regime, application preparation cost of £670,000 is excluded and determination costs are applied only, to be consistent with Option 1. For a full explanation of the approach, see Paragraph 3.27 of this paper. Fees for DNS are added as the Arup Report confirms the cost of £670,000 not applied for highways schemes includes DNS planning application fees;
- For developer costs where certain applications are to be submitted to LPAs under any new process, DNS costs from Arup Report have been applied, with DNS planning application fees subtracted and estimated LPA fee added. Fees for DNS are subtracted as the Arup Report confirms cost of £670,000 provided for application preparation includes DNS planning application fees, whilst these applications would be determined by LPAs rather than the Welsh Ministers under a new IC regime. The report does not specify what these fees are and therefore they have been subtracted based on DNS baseline developer costs as taken from: [Developments of National Significance Procedural Guidance 2019](#).

**Option 2 – Statutory Consultees costs per annum – Participation in a new IC regime**

3.56 Overall costs to statutory consultees for participating in a new IC regime are estimated to be **£35,093** per annum. A detailed breakdown of these costs is provided below:

<b>Table S – Breakdown of costs per annum to statutory consultees for participating in a new IC regime under Option 2</b>	
<b>Regime</b>	<b>Cost</b>
New IC process	<p>(Based on costs for DNS) Arup Report identified 5 DNS applications with a total of 8 statutory consultee responses. Therefore average of <math>(8/5) = 1.6</math> statutory consultee responses per application (A.).</p> <p>Arup Report estimated costs to statutory consultees ranging from £2,125 to £6,100 per DNS application = median cost of £4,113 per application (B.).</p> <p>Average cost per application = <math>(A. \times B.) = £6,580</math> (C.).</p> <p>Based on findings over the nine year assessed period that 44 applications would be determined under a new IC process going forward <math>(44/9) = 4.9</math> IC applications per annum (D.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = <math>(C. \times D.) = £32,169</math> (E.).</p>
Additional costs in responding to infrastructure applications that as a result of a new IC process would be determined by LPAs	<p>Based on costs for DNS) Arup Report identified 5 DNS applications with a total of 8 statutory consultee responses. Therefore average of <math>(8/5) = 1.6</math> statutory consultee responses per application (F.).</p> <p>Arup Report estimated costs to statutory consultees ranging from £2,125 to £6,100 per DNS application = median cost of £4,113 per application (G.).</p>

	<p>Average cost per application = (F. x G.) = £6,580 (H.).</p> <p>Based on 4 DNS applications found over the nine year assessed period that would be determined by LPAs going forward (4/9) = 0.44 infrastructure schemes to be determined by LPAs per annum, of those previously determined by the Welsh Ministers as DNS (I.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = (H. x I.) = £2,924 (J.).</p>
<b>Total cost to statutory consultees per annum for participating in a new IC regime under Option 2</b>	<b>(sum (E.) + (J.)) = £35,093 per annum.</b>

3.57 The above costings are based on the following assumptions:

- Statutory consultee costs for participating in a new IC process are expected to align with those for participating in the current DNS process. This is due to the nature of statutory consultee responses for infrastructure schemes not expected to substantially change under any new process compared to the current DNS regime. In this regard, costs have again been taken from the Arup Report for DNS and applied accordingly to estimate statutory consultee costs under Option 2.
- There are expected additional costs to statutory consultees for responding to infrastructure applications that under current processes would be determined as DNS, but under a new IC process would be too small to be considered as ICs and therefore determined by LPAs. These costs are again anticipated to align with those for statutory consultees participating in the current DNS process, as although considered small in scale they would facilitate responses of a nature commensurate with infrastructure schemes determined under the current DNS regime. Estimates of those expected additional costs are provided in the table above.

## **Detailed Approaches and Assumptions – Option 3 – Establish an independent consenting body to determine ‘Welsh Infrastructure Consents’**

### ***Option 3 – General Principles***

3.58 Under this option, as detailed in the assessment, there would be an independent body responsible for the processing and determination of IC applications. It is therefore assumed initial costs for set-up of the organisation would be funded by the Welsh Government and ongoing costs would be funded by the independent body, but recouped by applicant fees.

### ***Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – General Assumptions***

3.59 In order to provide some context to the costs outlined for running an IC Independent Body under this option, some previous case study examples provide useful comparable costs. For PINS Wales (now PEDW) which are responsible for DNS and other planning tasks, including appeals, a full breakdown of its running costs from 2015 to 2019 is provided in Annex 5 of the RIA. The budget for PINS Wales was £2,252,000 for financial year 2018/19. This covered:

- Direct running costs of the dedicated Inspector resource for Wales;
- Direct running costs for PINS office staff based in Cathays Park;
- Accommodation costs for Cathays Park; and
- A percentage of the PINS overall overhead costs to fund infrastructure service provision including IT, Human Resources and insurance.

3.60 The closest equivalent to such an Independent Body was the Infrastructure Planning Commission (“IPC”) which operated in England from 2008 to 2011. The costs and resources associated with the set-up and running of the IPC can be used, and appropriately amended to the IC process, as a basis for establishing the structure, resources, and costs of the SIP Independent Body. The Planning Bill Impact Assessment (UK Government, November 2007) estimated a one-off cost of setting up Infrastructure Planning Commission to be £5 million, with accommodation and staffing costs of £9.3 million per annum. Taking into account inflation, this would result in higher set-up and ongoing costs today. However, it is recognised an IC Independent Body for Wales would be smaller in scale and therefore have lower set-up and annual costs in comparison.

3.61 The costings for the IC Independent Body are based on the following general assumptions:

- A number of estimated costs for the independent body are based upon the conferring by Welsh Ministers of awarding and regulatory functions on a statutory ‘arms-length’ Welsh Government Sponsored Body, Qualifications Wales. These costs are contained in Option 3

of the Regulatory Impact Assessment<sup>12</sup> associated with the Qualifications Wales Bill. It is considered the Qualifications Wales example provides a strong comparable to the proposed structure of an independent body for the determining of IC applications.

- It is recognised costs for Qualifications Wales are dated 2015 and therefore more recent comparables for the setting up of organisational functions have been considered alongside these figures where appropriate, including for the set-up of PEDW within the Welsh Government. Where Qualifications Wales costs dated 2015 have been explicitly referenced, they have been updated to account for inflation for the purposes of the assessment
- The full staff complement of the Option 3 Qualifications Wales organisation is estimated at 73, based on its RIA. In addition to these staff are the organisation’s Governance Board who total 11, bringing the total staff complement for this Option to 84. This compares to an estimated (22 full time staff plus 11 board members) 33 members staff for our option of an independent determination body in the assessment. Where costs from the Qualifications Wales Bill Regulatory Impact Assessment have been directly utilised that relate to numbers of staff for the IC Independent Body option, the following ratio has been applied:

<b>Table T – Applied Qualifications Wales staffing figures in calculating costs for an IC Independent Body</b>	
Formula	
Formula applied for IC Independent Body costs, where costs relate to numbers of staff. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Staff total Qualifications Wales (including board members) = 84 (A.).</li> <li>• Staff total IC Independent Body (including board members) = 33 (B.).</li> </ul>	$(B.) / (A.) \times 100 = 39\%$ of Qualifications Wales costs applied to align with estimated staffing levels for the IC Independent Body.

- The number of applications has been based on the same number of infrastructure applications for a new IC regime under Option 2 at approximately 4.9 per year. This is because the process under this option will capture the same number and type of applications as Option 2, but with an arm’s length body responsible for their determination rather than the Welsh Ministers. On this basis costs for the composition of the independent body have been identified, which apply to its staffing arrangements in particular.

<sup>12</sup> [Qualifications Wales Bill EMRIA, June 2015.](#)

**Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Staffing**

3.62 The costings for staffing levels of the IC Independent Body are based on a number of considerations, as outlined below.

*Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Day-to-day staff structure and costs*

3.63 Costs for day-to-day staffing levels of the IC Independent Body are estimated at **£1,391,675** per annum. A detailed breakdown of the numbers of day-to-day staff for the IC Independent Body, their grades at an equivalent to Welsh Government level, and their costs are as follows:

<b>Table U – Day-to-day staff structure and costs for IC Independent Body</b>				
Role	Number of positions	Welsh Government Grade	Annual staff cost per role <sup>13</sup>	Total staff costs per annum (£)
Chief Executive	1 FTE	5	£120,174	120,174
Operational Lead / Deputy Chief Executive	1 FTE	7	£86,731	86,731
Inspector	2 FTE	N/A – Based on PEDW Grade 6 equivalent costs	£117,705 <sup>14</sup>	235,410
Inspector	2 FTE	N/A – Based on PEDW Grade 7 equivalent costs	£95,215 <sup>15</sup>	190,430
Planning Team Leader	1 FTE	SEO	£66,364	66,364
Planning Officer	4 FTE	HEO	£52,774	211,096
HR Manager	1 FTE	HEO	£52,774	52,774
Business Support Lead (including pay-roll responsibilities)	1 FTE	HEO	£52,774	52,774
ICT Manager	1 FTE	HEO	£52,774	52,774

<sup>13</sup> Staff costs based on average pay costs for Welsh Government staff in financial year 2022/23. Provided by Welsh Government Finance & Corporate Services in January 2023.

<sup>14</sup> For inspector costs, these are based on actual PEDW Inspector staff costs provided by PEDW in January 2023. It is considered appropriate to use these figures as they are more reflective of costs required to staff inspectors, compared to standard equivalent Welsh Government grades.

<sup>15</sup> As previous footnote.

Assistant Planning Officer	4 FTE	EO	£40,504	162,016
Customer Support / Communications	1 FTE	EO	£40,504	40,504
IT Support	1 FTE	HEO	£52,774	52,774
Business Support (receptionist)	2 FTE	TS	£33,927	67,854
<b>Total</b>	<b>22</b>			<b>£1,391,675</b>

3.64 The above breakdown of staffing levels and their costs for a new IC Independent Body is based on the assumption they will be similar to the organisational structure of PEDW because they determine a comparable number of infrastructure applications per year. It is considered necessary for the independent organisation to adopt a similar structure to PEDW to ensure its efficiency and deliverability in processing IC applications. Some new staff responsibilities will be introduced due to the autonomous nature of a new agency and those anticipated responsibilities have also been factored into the above structure and its costings.

*Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Governance Board structure and costs*

3.65 The level of involvement of the Governance Board for Qualifications Wales is considered comparable to involvement a Governance Board would have in an IC Independent Body; hence, applying a similar structure to the Qualifications Wales Board with a chairman and 10 board members and associated costs for the IC Independent Body is considered appropriate in this instance. Costs for the Governance Board of the IC Independent Body are therefore based upon estimated figures for remuneration of the Qualifications Wales Board, at £35,000 and £7,500 for a chairman and 10 board members respectively<sup>16</sup>. Final costs for the Governance Board of the IC Independent Body have been calculated on that basis and are estimated to be **£132,330** per annum. A detailed breakdown of these costs are as follows:

<sup>16</sup> As taken from Paragraph 15 of the [Qualifications Wales Bill EMRIA, June 2015](#).

<b>Table V – Governance Board – IC Independent Body</b>	
Formula	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Chairman cost for Qualifications Wales Governance Board, estimate from June 2015 = £35,000 (A.).</li> <li>Applied inflation figure of 1.203 (B.) to convert 2015/2016 cost to current price.</li> </ul>	<b>(A.) x (B.) = £42,105 estimated cost for IC Independent Body Governance Board Chairman per annum.</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Board member costs for Qualifications Wales Governance Board, estimated from June 2015 = £7,500, on an individual basis (C.).</li> <li>Number of board members in total = 10 (D.).</li> <li>Applied inflation figure of 1.203 (E.) to convert 2015/2016 cost to current price.</li> </ul>	<b>(C.) x (D.) x (E.) = £90,225 estimated cost for IC Independent Body Governance Board Members per annum. Costs for board members on an individual basis at £9,023 per annum.</b>
<b>Total staff costs 11 IC Independent Body Governance Board Members</b>	<b>£132,330 per annum.</b>

*Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Staff recruitment, relocation and training*

3.66 Costs for recruitment, relocation and training of staff (for new systems etc.) are based on figures for the set-up of the staffing structure for Qualifications Wales, applied for the purposes of the IC Independent Body and estimated at **£137,936**. A detailed breakdown of these costs are as follows:

<b>Table W – Recruitment, Relocation and Training of Staff – IC Independent Body</b>	
Formula	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2015/2016 set-up for recruitment, relocation and training of Qualifications Wales staff = £294,000 (A.)<sup>17</sup>.</li> <li>Applied inflation figure of 1.203 (B.) to convert 2015/2016 cost to current price.</li> <li>Apply staffing formula of 39%, multiply by 0.39 (C.), to align with staffing levels for a new IC body.</li> </ul>	<b>(A.) x (B.) x (C.) = £137,936 estimated cost for recruitment, relocation and training of staff for the IC Independent Body.</b>

<sup>17</sup> As taken from Paragraph 82 of the [Qualifications Wales Bill EMRIA, June 2015](#).

*Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Staff contingency costs*

3.67 Additional staff contingency costs at 10% of total staff costs are estimated at **£152,401** per annum and are included in order to take into account factors such as travel and subsistence and auditing. The 10% figure is considered realistic and has been informed by estimates of contingency costs for the planning provisions contained in the Planning (Wales) Bill RIA dated April 2015. A detailed breakdown of these costs are as follows:

<b>Table X – Staff Contingency Costs – IC Independent Body</b>	
Formula	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Total costs for day-to-day staffing of the IC Independent Body = £1,391,675 (A.) per annum (as evidenced above).</li> <li>• Total costs for Governance Board Members of the IC Independent Body = £132,330 (B.) per annum (as evidenced above).</li> <li>• Applying 10% of total staff costs, multiply by 0.1 (C.), in order to obtain staff contingency costs.</li> </ul>	<p><b><math>((A.) + (B.)) \times (C.) = £152,401</math> per annum estimated staff contingency cost for IC Independent Body.</b></p>

*Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Legal and Other Professional Services*

3.68 The IC Independent Body would require a budget for legal and other professional services, including translation. It is considered these costs would be comparable to those for similar services that would apply to Qualifications Wales. Costs for those services have therefore been calculated on that basis, at an estimated total of **£368,118** per annum. A detailed breakdown of these costs are as follows:

<b>Table Y – Legal and Other Professional Services – IC Independent Body</b>	
Formula	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Legal and other professional services costs for Qualifications Wales, estimate from June 2015 = £306,000 (A.).</li> <li>• Applied inflation figure of 1.203 (B.) to convert 2015/2016 cost to current price.</li> </ul>	<p><b><math>(A.) \times (B.) = £368,118</math> estimated cost for IC Independent Body legal and other professional services per annum.</b></p>

3.69 It is not considered costs for legal and other professional services for an IC Independent Body in comparison to Qualifications Wales would be affected by differences in staffing levels between the two organisations. Therefore, the above calculation does not align Qualifications Wales staffing levels with those for the IC Independent Body.

**Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Training and dissemination for a new IC regime**

3.70 Under this option it is considered there would be further costs for training and dissemination, with regards to implementing a new IC regime at a total cost of (A. + B.) **£25,965**. Arrangements would be similar to under Option 2, where Welsh Government officials would deliver the training at a cost of **£6,988** (A.). However, there would be a cost for training IC Independent Body staff with responsibility for the regime, rather than all PEDW staff (whose functions would not fall under the remit of a new regime for this option). Costs for training the IC Independent Body on a new IC regime are estimated to be a one-off cost of **£18,977** (B.). A detailed breakdown of these costs are as follows:

<b>Table Z – Welsh Government Training and Dissemination for New IC Regime – Costs for IC Independent Body officials to attend training</b>								
Task	Grade 5 cost (x1 attending)	Grade 6 Inspector costs (x2 attending)	Grade 7 Inspector costs (x2 attending)	Grade 7 cost (x1 attending)	SEO cost (x1 attending)	HEO costs (x8 attending)	EO costs (x5 attending)	TS costs (x2 attending)
3 full day training events	£1,639	£3,210	£2,597	£1,183	£905	£5,757	£2,762	£925
<b>Total dissemination / familiarisation costs</b>						<b>£18,977</b>		

3.71 Costs for training the IC Independent Body are based on the staffing structure and costs outlined previously for the organisation, with each staff member having 3 full days training on the new IC regime.

**Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Guidance**

3.72 See costs for standalone guidance under Option 2. This cost would apply to the Welsh Government who would retain responsibility for overarching policy implementation under this option.

### Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – IT Infrastructure

3.73 IT set-up and ongoing costs for a new organisation are considered to be comparable to the similar costs for Qualifications Wales, which included a hybrid of cloud-based and server-based infrastructure. For an IC Independent Body, there is also a need to factor in additional costs for a public facing IT service for the submission of IC applications; where costs have been based on the “Planning Applications Wales” service which enables electronic submission of planning applications to local planning authorities in Wales<sup>18</sup>. These costs have been calculated on that basis, with estimated total set-up cost of **£684,733**. A detailed breakdown of these costs are as follows:

Table AA – IT Set-Up – IC Independent Body	
Formula	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>IT set-up costs for Qualifications Wales, estimate from June 2015 = £1,244,000 (A.). This cost is based on £664,000 ICT infrastructure capital set-up costs and £580,000 ICT on consultancy support, WAN and other software<sup>19</sup>.</li> <li>Applied inflation figure of 1.203 (B.) to convert 2015/2016 costs to current prices.</li> <li>Apply staffing formula of 39%, multiply by 0.39 (C.), to align with staffing levels for a new IC body. It is considered these costs will cover relevant equipment for members of staff and board members of the organisation.</li> <li>IT set-up cost for public facing service allowing electronic submission of IC applications to the independent body. Figure based on set-up cost for “Planning Applications Wales”, which was £87,143 in 2017/2018 (D.).</li> <li>Applied inflation figure of 1.160 (E.), to convert 2017/2018 cost to current price.</li> </ul>	$((A.) \times (B.) \times (C.)) + ((D.) \times (E.)) = \mathbf{£684,733 \text{ estimated cost for IC Independent Body IT set-up.}}$

3.74 The estimated set-up cost for IT infrastructure is comparable to recent costs for transferring the IT systems of Planning Inspectorate (PINS) Wales into the Welsh Government as PEDW (estimated at approximately £500,000 in total by planning officials of the Welsh Government

<sup>18</sup> The Welsh Government’s Planning Directorate procures the Planning Applications Wales service and therefore holds information on its running costs.

<sup>19</sup> As taken from Pages 123 to 125 of the [Qualifications Wales Bill EMRIA, June 2015](#).

working on the project). Therefore, by the similar nature of planning service both PEDW and a new IC Independent Body would provide, the estimated cost is considered to be justified.

3.75 Estimated ongoing costs for IT infrastructure are estimated at **£312,799** per annum. A detailed breakdown of these costs are as follows:

<b>Table AB – IT Ongoing – IC Independent Body</b>	
Formula	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>IT ongoing costs for Qualifications Wales, estimate from June 2015 = £504,000. This cost is based on consultancy £95,000, WAN £87,000, other Software £70,000, Microsoft Support £47,000, hardware £27,000, hosting and license £178,000<sup>20</sup>.</li> <li>Applied inflation figure of 1.203 (B.) to convert 2015/2016 costs to current prices.</li> <li>Apply staffing formula of 39%, multiply by 0.39 (C.), to align with staffing levels for a new IC body. It is considered these costs will cover relevant equipment for members of staff and board members of the organisation.</li> <li>IT ongoing cost for public facing service allowing electronic submission of IC applications to the independent body. Figure based on current costs for delivery of “Planning Applications Wales”, which is £76,337 per annum (D.).</li> </ul>	<p><b><math>((A.) \times (B.) \times (C.)) + (D.) = \text{£312,799 estimated IT cost per annum for IC Independent Body.}</math></b></p>

3.76 This estimated ongoing IT operating cost is comparable to the running cost of similar infrastructure for PINS Wales before it became part of the Welsh Government, where the running costs amounted to approximately £282,015<sup>21</sup> per annum in 2019. This figure is considered to provide a reasonable comparable to IT costs for the new organisation per annum as they are expected to be similar in nature, with both contributing to bespoke ICT operating systems for similar staffing levels.

<sup>20</sup> As taken from Pages 123 to 125 of the [Qualifications Wales Bill EMRIA, June 2015](#).

<sup>21</sup> A new Planning Inspectorate for Wales Business Case, October 2019, Welsh Government.

**Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Accommodation**

3.77 Accommodation costs for the IC Independent Body are estimated to be **£193,113** for their set-up (comprising of fixtures and fittings), with an annual cost of **£81,523** (£42,500 rental + £39,023 facilities) and **no depreciation cost** after 5 years (excluding IT for which ongoing maintenance costs are already estimated). A detailed breakdown of the costs associated with the above is provided in the sections that follow.

*Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Details of accommodation and annual rental costs*

3.78 The type of accommodation and annual rental costs for accommodation that would be occupied by an IC Independent Body are estimated to be as follows:

<b>Table AC – Details of accommodation and annual rental costs – IC Independent Body</b>	
Formula	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Number of staff expected to occupy office space for an IC Independent Body = 22. (A.). This figure excludes the 11 board members for the organisation, as they would not be working at the organisation on a day-to-day basis and would operate on a basis of meeting intermittently. It is further anticipated they would be likely to carry out the majority of their duties remotely.</li> <li>The Welsh Government’s Remote Working Policy aims for 70% of staff to be working in the office, with the remaining 30% to be working at or nearer to home on a regular basis. It is considered reasonable to assume a similar percentage of staff would work in the office for an IC Independent Body. Therefore, total staff working in the office at any one time for the IC Independent Body = (A.) x 0.7 (applying 70% as a ratio) = 16 (B.) (rounded up to the nearest whole number in this case as applying figure to individual persons).</li> <li>Assumption of 110 sq. foot (C.) of office space (equating to 10 sq. metres office space) required per person. This assumption is based on similar arrangements of working space for WG estates, noting 11 sq. metres per person for Oak House, Newport (as taken from estimate of costs for Commission for Tertiary Education and Research, dated April 2021).</li> <li>For an office space that would be occupied by 16 staff, it is considered reasonable to assume a total floorspace of approximately (B. x C., rounded to the nearest 1,000) = 2,000 sq. foot (D.) would be required for an IC Independent Body.</li> </ul>	<p>(D. x E.) = <b>£42,500 estimated accommodation annual rental costs for IC Independent Body.</b></p>

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Annual rental costs for such premises are estimated by the Welsh Government's Property Infrastructure Division to fall between £20-£22.50 per sq. foot<sup>22</sup>. This cost is based on an assumption of the need to utilise existing office space within the Cardiff city centre area for the set-up of a new IC Independent Body. Therefore, a median annual rental cost of £21.25 per sq. foot (E.) has been applied for the purposes of this assessment.</li> </ul>	
---	--

*Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Accommodation fixtures and fittings*

3.79 With regards to set-up of accommodation for an IC Independent Body, there would be initial costs for fixtures and fittings that are estimated to be as follows:

<b>Table AD – Accommodation Fixtures and Fittings – IC Independent Body</b>	
Formula	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Estimates of accommodation costs for Commission for Tertiary Education and Research, dated April 2021, have been applied for the purposes of calculating fixtures and fittings. These cost estimates are as follows:</li> <li>Furniture costs at £3,225 per workstation; applying the ratio of 5 workstations to every 10 members of staff, it is assumed 8 workstation would be required in this case for 16 members of staff. Total cost for furniture/workstations is therefore estimated at (£3,225 x 8) = £25,800 (A.).</li> <li>Removal of existing staff at £12 per person; if like for like replacement of staff for a new IC Independent Body, we would assume this would equate to removal of 16 members of staff at a total of (£12 x 16) = £192 (B.).</li> <li>Capital fit-out works, assumed this would be for second hand purpose built office space at a cost of £850 per sq. metre; with the accommodation space estimated to be 2,000 sq. foot, this equates to</li> </ul>	<p><b>((A.) + (B.) + (C.)) x (D.) = £193,113 estimated set-up costs of accommodation fixtures and fittings for IC Independent Body.</b></p>

<sup>22</sup> Based on estimate of costs provided by the Welsh Government's Property Infrastructure Division on the 22 September 2022.

<p>186 sq. metres. Therefore, total capital fit-out works costs for accommodation are estimated at (£850 x 186) = £158,100 (C.).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>As above costs are taken from information provided in April 2021, the inflation figure of 1.049 (D.) is to be applied to convert 2021/2022 costs to current prices.</li> </ul>	
--	--

3.80 Further to the above, no ongoing costs have been applied for fixtures and fittings as it is considered such a cost would be negligible over the five year appraisal period for the purposes of this assessment. For instance, it is not considered furniture would need to be replaced over the five year period.

*Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Accommodation facilities*

3.81 There would be ongoing facilities costs that would apply to accommodation for an IC Independent Body, estimated to be as follows:

<b>Table AE – Accommodation Facilities – IC Independent Body</b>	
Formula	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Estimates of accommodation costs for Commission for Tertiary Education and Research, dated April 2021, have been applied for the purposes of calculating costs for facilities. These cost estimates are as follows:</li> <li>Rates at a cost of £37.50 per sq. metre. Applied to accommodation of £2,000 sq. foot, equating to 186 sq. metres, total costs for rates per annum are estimated at (£37.50 x 186) = £6,975 (A.).</li> <li>Other costs are estimated at £162.50 per sq. metre. It is considered these other costs would comprise of general costs for facilities. Applied to accommodation of £2,000 sq. foot, equating to 186 sq. metres, total costs for facilities per annum are estimated at (£162.50 x 186) = £30,225 (B.).</li> <li>As above costs are taken from information provided in April 2021, the inflation figure of 1.049 (C.) is to be applied to convert 2021/2022 costs to current prices.</li> </ul>	<p><b>((A.) + (B.)) x (C.) = £39,023 estimated costs per annum for accommodation facilities for IC Independent Body.</b></p>

3.82 The above costs for facilities are considered to flatline over the five year appraisal period and incorporate costs for rates, provision of utilities, repairs and maintenance and office administration. It is assumed costs for office administration will be insignificant as most of the work of the IC Independent Body in processing applications will be undertaken electronically through the IT equipment already costed.

*Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Accommodation depreciation*

3.83 On the basis of applying the five year appraisal period for the purposes of this assessment, it is considered there would be no additional depreciation costs after five years for the running of accommodation of an IC Independent Body. Costs for IT maintenance are already provided in this assessment as part of the calculation of ongoing IT costs. It is recognised that furniture would need to be replaced over time, however it is considered this would take place after 10 years rather than five<sup>23</sup>.

**Option 3 – IC Independent Body costs – Insurance**

3.84 Annual costs for insurance per staff member of the IC Independent Body have been based upon comparable costs for Qualifications Wales and are estimated to be **£41,605** per annum. A detailed breakdown of these costs are as follows:

<b>Table AF – Insurance – IC Independent Body</b>	
Formula	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Insurance cost per staff member for Qualifications Wales, June 2015 = £1,048 (A.).</li> <li>Applied inflation figure of 1.203 (B.) to convert 2015/2016 costs to current prices.</li> <li>Staffing arrangements for IC Independent Body, including board members = 33 (C.).</li> </ul>	<p><b>(A.) x (B.) x (C.) = £41,605 estimated annual insurance cost for IC Independent Body.</b></p>

<sup>23</sup> Estimates of accommodation costs for Commission for Tertiary Education and Research, dated April 2021, forecast that refurbishment costs for accommodation, including furniture, would be required over a 10-yearly period.

**Option 3 – LPA costs – Participation in a new IC regime that is the responsibility of an IC Independent Body**

3.85 Costs to LPAs for participation in a new IC regime under Option 3 would be the same as for Option 2. For a detailed breakdown of these costs, see: “Option 2 – LPA costs – Participation in a new IC regime”.

**Option 3 – Developer costs – Participation in a new IC regime that is the responsibility of an IC Independent Body**

3.86 Costs to developers for participation in a new IC regime to be run by an IC Independent Body under Option 3 are estimated to be the same set-up costs as Option 2 at **£3,030**, but with different ongoing costs of **£5,390,317** per annum. A detailed breakdown of ongoing costs to developers under this option are as follows:

<b>Table AG – Developer Costs Per Annum – IC Independent Body</b>	
Formula	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Developer costs for applications to be determined by an IC Independent Body under a new IC regime:</li> <li>• £897,230 (A.) (total cost to developers per application that has been applied for Option 2, excluding highways schemes);</li> <li>• As fees would be made up of costs for running the IC Independent Body, see bullet point below, existing DNS fees are subtracted. These are £227,230 (B.), £580 (C.), £15,350 (D.), £7,750 (E.) and £14,700 (F.) (fees evidenced by the Arup Report plus DNS notification fee, initial fee, Local Impact Report fee and determination fee respectively).</li> <li>• Figure multiplied by total number of applications. 6 highways schemes that would be determined as ICs discounted from this part of the calculation<sup>24</sup>. Therefore applies to ((44 – 6)/9) 4.2 (G.) applications in total.</li> </ul>	<p><b>(H.) + (I.) + (J.) = £5,390,317 estimated annual cost to developers for new IC regime run by an IC Independent Body.</b></p>

<sup>24</sup> Only determination costs have been applied to developer costs for highways schemes across all options; see Paragraph 3.27 of this paper. Determination costs to developers for highways schemes would be covered under costs incurred on developers for the running of the IC Independent body; see bullet point below in main text.

- Therefore, total cost to developers, excluding application fees is ((A.) – (B.) – (C.) – (D.) – (E.) – (F.)) x (G.) = £2,666,840 (H.).
- Additional entire ongoing cost to developers per annum for running the service of IC Independent Body, which would essentially be the fee element as it would operate on a full cost recovery basis = £2,480,451 (I.)<sup>25</sup>. This figure is based on previous costs for an IC Independent Body outlined above, including staff, insurance, and accommodation etc.
- Additional cost for infrastructure applications to be determined by LPAs and not under a new IC regime. This is the same as evidenced under Option 2 at £243,026 (J.).

***Option 3 – Statutory Consultees costs per annum – Participation in a new IC regime that is the responsibility of an IC Independent Body***

3.87 See costs identified for statutory consultees under Option 2 for a new IC regime, which are expected to apply under this option.

<sup>25</sup> To note, applying this figure as a fee on an individual application basis, this would result in a fee to developers of (divided by (44/9) 4.9 applications estimated per year) £507,365 per application.

## Detailed Approaches and Assumptions – Option 4 – Establish fast-track and consistent infrastructure consenting regimes to be determined by a unit within the Welsh Government

### *Option 4 – General Principles*

- 3.88 Under this option, as detailed in the assessment, there would be amendments to secondary legislation for the various infrastructure consenting regimes to ensure greater consistency. There would be a new unit within the Welsh Government responsible for issuing decisions on behalf of the Welsh Ministers.
- 3.89 For this option, as the infrastructure consenting regimes would remain the same as for Option 1, the majority of costs have been applied on that basis.
- 3.90 However, in ensuring more consistent and simplified processes through amendments to legislation, it is considered there would be possible efficiency savings through concurrent examination of applications, and providing an appropriate fee structure to ensure full cost recovery across all case types.
- 3.91 Due to similar regimes being in place as under Option 1, albeit with modifications to ensure improved processes, it is expected costs to local planning authorities and statutory consultees under this option would remain the same as for Option 1.

### *Option 4 – Developer costs per annum – Fast-track and consistent infrastructure consenting regimes*

- 3.92 Costs to developers for participation in improved infrastructure consenting regimes under Option 4 are estimated to be **£4,757,856** per annum. A detailed breakdown of these costs are as follows:

<b>Table AH – Breakdown of costs per annum to the development industry for fast-track and consistent infrastructure consenting regimes under Option 4.</b>	
Regime	Cost
Planning permission under section 57(1) of the TCPA	£0 (A.).
Developments of National Significance (DNS) permission under s.62D of the TCPA 1990	36 DNS in total over the nine year assessed period. Number in total per year = $36 / 9 = 4$ (B.). Developer costs of £897,230 (C.).

	<p>Total cost per annum = (B. x C.) = £3,588,920 (D.).</p>
<p>Consent to construct and operate generating stations under section 36 of the Electricity Act 1989</p>	<p>2 generating stations under the Electricity Act over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of generating stations per annum = <math>2 / 9 = 0.2</math> (E.).</p> <p>Generating stations under the Electricity Act made up of preparation costs from Arup Report, plus baseline DNS application costs, plus additional DNS application costs from Arup Report = + £1,373,889 + £38,380 + £227,230 = £1,639,499 (F.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = (E. x F.) = £364,333 (G.).</p>
<p>Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under the Harbours Act 1964</p>	<p>5 Harbour Orders over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of Harbour Order applications per annum = <math>5 / 9 = 0.6</math> (H.).</p> <p>Harbour Orders made up of preparation costs from Arup Report, plus baseline DNS application costs, plus additional DNS application costs from Arup Report = £176,333 + £38,380 + £227,230 = £441,943 (I.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = (H. x I.) = £245,524 (J.).</p>
<p>Orders under the Transport and Works Act 1992</p>	<p>1 Transport and Works Order over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of anticipated Transport and Works Order applications per annum = <math>1 / 9 = 0.1</math> (K.).</p> <p>Transport and Works Orders made up of preparation costs from Arup Report, plus baseline DNS application costs, plus additional DNS application costs from Arup Report = £2,110,000 + £38,380 + £227,230 = £2,375,610 (L.).</p>

	Total cost per annum = (K. x L.) = £263,957 (M.)
Orders under the Highways Act 1980	<p>10 Highways Orders over the nine year assessed period.</p> <p>Number of anticipated Highways Order applications per annum = <math>10 / 9 = 1.1</math> (N.).</p> <p>Highways Orders made up of baseline DNS application costs, plus additional DNS application costs from Arup Report = <math>£38,380 + £227,230 = £265,610</math> (O.).</p> <p>Total cost per annum = (N. x O.) = £295,122 (P.).</p>
<b>Total cost to the development industry per annum for fast-track and consistent infrastructure consenting regimes under Option 4.</b>	<b>(sum (A.), (D.), (G.), (J.), (M.), (P.)) = £4,757,856 per annum.</b>

3.93 Costs to the development industry for participation in improved infrastructure consenting regimes under this option are similar to developer costs under Option 1, aside from the following caveats:

- For consenting regimes other than DNS, it is considered amendments are likely to be made to align them closer with the requirements and fee structures of the DNS consenting regime in order to achieve greater consistency and efficiencies. Therefore costs per application would generally follow the DNS model. This has resulted in costs per application for those other regimes being calculated on the basis of only taking the average preparation costs for each type of consenting regime from the Arup Report , and adding it to the baseline DNS application costs and additional DNS application costs.
- Baseline DNS application costs are taken from [Developments of National Significance Procedural Guidance 2019](#) and are made up of £580 notification fee, £15,350 initial fee, £7,750 Local Impact Report fee and £14,700 determination fee.
- Additional DNS application costs are taken from the Arup Report and total £227,230. These costs are made up of other application costs to the developer such as examination fee and undertaking pre-application consultation.
- The only exception to the above is for Highways Orders, where although DNS costs have been applied, average preparation costs have been excluded from the calculation. This is because only determination costs have been applied to developer costs for highways schemes across all options; see Paragraph 3.27 of this paper.

**Option 4 – Welsh Government costs – Guidance for fast-track and consistent infrastructure consenting regimes**

3.94 Standalone guidance on the new requirements for improvements to existing regimes is estimated would cost the Welsh Government **£4,202**. A detailed breakdown of those costs by Welsh Government staff grade and task is provided below:

<b>Table AI – Welsh Government Guidance for Fast-Track and Consistent Infrastructure Consenting Regimes</b>		
<b>Task</b>	<b>SEO Cost</b>	<b>HEO Cost</b>
Initial preparation of guidance (15 days)	£0	£3,598
Final clearance of guidance (2 days)	£603	£0
<b>Total costs</b>	<b>£4,202</b>	

3.95 The above costings are based upon the following make up of tasks and assumptions:

- There would be 5 new guidance documents for improvements to existing infrastructure consenting regimes. This figure has been based on the range of topic areas covered by the legislation for those existing regimes, namely DNS and planning, harbours, highways, transport and electricity;
- Delivery by 1 SEO and 1 HEO planning officials of the Welsh Government. HEO responsible for preparation, with each guidance document taking 3 working days to prepare, and SEO clearing contents, with up to 3 guidance documents being cleared over a working day; and
- Staff costs are based on Welsh Government annual gross salary costs for 2022/2023 broken down by daily rate, at 220 working days per year.

## Annex A - Breakdown of PEDW and the Welsh Government's costs for determining infrastructure applications

Stage	Task	Average Time Required (hours).				WG grade
		Low complexity case	Medium complexity case	High complexity case		
Pre-application	Inception Meetings and non-charged Pre-Application Advice (including general queries)		3.70	3.70	3.70	TS
			2.00	2.00	2.00	HEO
			4.70	6.70	12.40	SEO
			333.53 (A.)	415.06 (a.)	647.41 (1.)	
	EIA screening and scoping					
			14.80	14.80	37.00	SEO
			603.31 (B.)	603.31 (b.)	1,508.27 (2.)	
	Notify applicant of decision to accept/refuse their notification to submit a DNS, including decision on whether application is indeed DNS or not					
			6.70	6.70	6.70	TS

					1.00	SEO
			139.63 (C.)	139.63 (c.)	180.39 (3.)	
	Formal pre-application advice, which extends to 'without prejudice' advice on the merits of proposed schemes as well as the procedural aspects of the DNS process					
			1.00	1.00	1.00	TS
			7.40	7.40	14.80	SEO
			322.49 (D.)	322.49 (d.)	624.15 (4.)	
Application	Registration and validation of application (including adequacy of EIA)		10.00	10.00	10.00	TS
			2.00	2.00	4.00	SEO
			22.20	37.00		G7 Ins
					44.40	G6 Ins
			1,588.31 (E.)	2,453.91 (e.)	3,581.59 (5.)	
	Notification of the validation decision, including the reasons why it has not been validated should that be the case (including translation)		3.00	3.00	5.00	TS
			2.00	2.00	4.00	SEO
			3.70	3.70		G7 Ins
					3.70	G6 Ins
			360.45 (F.)	360.45 (f.)	534.77 (6.)	
	Notification letters to statutory consultees and interested parties and organisations (including neighbour notification letters and notification of Community Councils)					
			7.40	7.40	14.80	TS
			1.00	1.00	2.00	HEO
			186.63 (G.)	186.63 (g.)	373.26 (7.)	

	Publishing application material on PEDW planning casework portal (to include GDPR reading)					
			22.20	22.20	25.90	TS
			462.64 (H.)	462.64 (h.)	539.75 (8.)	
	Checking LIR and dealing with representations		2.00	2.00	2.00	TS
			18.50	29.60	40.00	TS
			1.00	1.00	2.00	SEO
			467.98 (I.)	699.30 (i.)	956.79 (9.)	
	Press notice fee					
	Press notice - staff cost					
			3.00	3.00	5.00	TS
			62.52 (J.)	62.52 (j.)	104.20 (10.)	
	Displaying site notice (for onshore proposals) - for LPAs					
	Pre-examination meeting (optional)					
		3.70	3.70	3.70	TS	

	Determination of 'notification of intention to vary' form submitted at the discretion of the developer (optional)		3.00	3.00		G7 Ins	
					6.00	G6 Ins	
			252.56 (K.)	252.56 (k.)	510.91 (11.)		
	Determination of applicants intention to vary (Case officer completes GDPR check / publishing, Inspector will assess if acceptable)		14.80	14.80	22.20	TS	
			3.00	3.00	7.40	G7 Ins	
					6.00	G6 Ins	
			483.89 (L.)	483.89 (l.)	1,329.24 (12.)		
	Suspension to an application		14.80	14.80	22.20	TS	
			7.40	7.40	14.80	G7 Ins	
			741.22 (M.)	741.22 (m.)	1,328.23 (13.)		
Examination	Appointment of Inspector to examine the application		7.40	7.40	7.40	EO	
			1.00	1.00		G7 Ins	
					1.00	G6 Ins	
			1.00	1.00	1.00	Deputy Director	
			316.41 (N.)	316.41 (n.)	330.23 (14.)		
	Organising site visit/s and venues						
			14.80	14.80	14.80	TS	
			308.43 (O.)	308.43 (o.)	308.43 (15.)		
	Determination of examination procedure and timetable						
			1.00	1.00	2.00	SEO	

				3.70	3.70		G7 Ins
						3.70	G6 Ins
				257.16 (P.)	257.16 (p.)	349.04 (16.)	
Option 1. Written representations							
Advertising - fee							
				£1,238.00 (Q.)	£1,530	£2,100	
Advertising - staff cost (covered earlier in process)							
Venue Hire - fee and staff cost, doesn't apply to written reps.							
Option 2. Open floor hearing							
Inspector input into examination sessions							
				22.2	44.4		G7 Ins
						74	G6 Ins
				£1,298.39	£2,596.78	£5,350.23	
Advertising - fee							
				£2,100	£2,341	£2,865	
Advert Translation Cost							
				£50	£50	£50	
Advert Translation Staff Cost							
				1	1	1	TS
Advertising - staff cost							
				4	4	6	TS
Advertising total cost							
				£154.20	£154.20	£195.88	

Venue Hire - fee				£0.00	£700.00	£1,050.00	
Simultaneous Translation Services				£3,800.00	£7,650.00	£12,000.00	
Event Administrator time				22.20	44.40	74.00	TS
Venue Hire and Services - staff cost				11.1	11.1	11.1	HEO
Venue Hire total cost				4,622.46	9,635.10	14,951.96	
Option 3. Topic-specific hearing							
Inspector input into examination sessions				22.2	44.4		G7 Ins
						74	G6 Ins
				£1,298.39	£2,596.78 (q.)	£5,350.23	
Advertising - fee				£2,100	£2,341 (r.)	£2,865	
Advert Translation Cost				£50	£50	£50	
Advert Translation Staff Cost				1	1	1	TS
Advertising - staff cost				4	4	6	TS
Advertising total cost				154.20	154.20 (s.)	195.88	
Venue Hire - fee				£0.00	£1,750.00	£2,100.00	
Simultaneous Translation Services				£3,800.00	£7,650.00	£12,000.00	
Event Administrator time				22.20	44.40	74.00	TS
Venue Hire - staff cost				7.4	7.4	7.4	HEO
Venue Hire total cost				4,502.52	10,565.16 (t.)	15,882.02	

Option 4. Inquiry							
Inspector input into examination sessions				22.2	44.4		G7 Ins
						74	G6 Ins
				£1,298.39	£2,596.78	£5,350.23 (17.)	
Advertising - fee				£2,100	£2,341.00	£2,865.00 (18.)	
Advert Translation Cost				£50.00	£50.00	£50.00	
Advert Translation Staff Cost				1	1	1	TS
Advertising - staff cost				4	4	6	TS
Advertising total cost				154.20	154.20	195.88 (19.)	
Venue Hire - fee				£0.00	£1,750.00	£2,100.00	
Simultaneous Translation Services				£3,800.00	£7,650.00	£12,000.00	
Event Administrator time				22.2	44.4	74	TS
Venue Hire - staff cost				7.4	7.4	7.4	HEO
Venue Hire total cost				4,502.52	10,565.16	15,882.02 (20.)	
Consideration by the appointed Inspector of all representations/matters raised and production of a report for Welsh Ministers recommending whether planning permission should be granted or refused.				296	644		G7 Ins
						1820	G6 Ins

	<i>These costs for examination, based on grades and staff time for examination of a DNS application, have been aligned to fees for examination set out in the Schedule of the Developments of National Significance (Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2016. -£870 per day for the determination of 'low complexity' applications by written representations. -£920 per day for the determination of medium or high complexity applications by hearing or inquiry</i>		14790.00 (R.)	32200.00 (u.)	125120.00 (21.)	
	Consultant or assessor costs		0.00	0.00	0.00	
	T&S costs (Inspector & Event Administrator)		540.00 (S.)	1080.00 (v.)	1800.00 (22.)	(£)
	Completion of report writing and presentation to Welsh Ministers (Inspector read & administration).		7.40	14.80	37.00	TS
	<i>These costs for examination, based on grades and staff time for examination of a DNS application, have been aligned to fees for examination set out in the Schedule of the Developments of National Significance (Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2016. -£870 per day for the determination of 'low complexity' applications by written representations. -£920 per day for the determination of medium or high complexity applications by hearing or inquiry</i>		14.80	22.20	74.00	G6 Ins
			1,740.00 (T.)	1,840.00 (w.)	6,440.00 (23.)	
Post-examination	Liaison, corrections and additional information between PINS and Decisions Branch					



	<b>Total costs for determining different complexities of infrastructure applications</b>	<b>Low complexity (sum from A. to AC.) = £32,154.01</b>	<b>Medium complexity (sum from a. to af.) = £76,084.34</b>	<b>High complexity (sum from 1. to 32.) = £208,145.69</b>	
--	--	---	--	---	--

<b>2022-23 Welsh Government salary costs (£)*</b>				
<b>Grade</b>	<b>Annual Average Gross Cost</b>	<b>Monthly Average Gross Cost</b>	<b>Hourly Average Gross Cost</b>	<b>Daily Average Gross cost</b>
TS**	33,927	2,827	20.84	154.21
EO	40,504	3,375	24.88	184.11
HEO	52,774	4,398	32.42	239.88
SEO	66,364	5,530	40.76	301.65
G7	86,731	7,228	53.27	394.23
G6	105,117	8,760	64.57	477.80
G7 Inspector***	95,215	7,935	58.49	432.80
G6 Inspector	117,705	9,809	72.30	535.02
Deputy Director	120,174	10,015	73.82	546.25

\* Assumption of 220 working days per year (260 weekdays per year minus 30 days AL minus 10 days privilege days) and 7.4 hours per day.

\*\* 2022-2023 staff costs supplied from Finance Services in Jan 2023.

\*\*\* G7 and G6 Inspector costs based on figures provided from PEDW as of 18 Jan 2023.

## Annex B - Applications submitted during the assessed period April 2013 to April 2022

Project Name	Consenting regime projects fall under	Current regime projects would be determined under
Maesygarth Solar Farm	Planning permission under s.57(1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990;	DNS
Cwmcaesingrug Farm Solar Farm	Planning permission under s.57(1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990;	DNS
Hendre Fawr Solar Farm	Planning permission under s.57(1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990;	DNS
Shotwick Solar Farm	Planning permission under s.57(1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990;	DNS
Bryn Blaen Windfarm	Planning permission under s.57(1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990;	DNS
Hendy Windfarm	Planning permission under s.57(1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990;	DNS
A4226 Five Mile Lane	Orders under s.10, s.14, s.16 or s.28 of the Highways Act 1980	Highways Act 1980
Egnedol Biomass sustainable energy facility	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS

Llanwern Solar	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Sudbrook - Peaking Gas	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Wauntysswg - Solar	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Valero - Cogeneration Facility	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Llangennech Solar Farm (previously Penderi / Felinfoel solar).	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Tycroes Solar.	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Mor Hafren Energy Recovery Facility.	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Upper Ogmere - Wind Turbines	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS

Blackberry Lane Solar Park.	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Buttington Quarry – ERF	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Brynwell Farm Renewable Energy Hub	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Elwy Solar Energy	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Brynryd Solar Farm.	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Rhoscrowther Wind Farm.	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Penpergwm Solar Farm.	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Parc Solar Traffwll Ltd.	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS

Coed Darcy - energy generation operating reserve compound	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Felindre Road - stand-by energy generating station	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Neath to Abergavenny Trunk Road (A465) (Abergavenny to Hirwaun Dualling and Slip Roads) and East of Abercynon to East of Dowlais Trunk Road (A4060) and Cardiff to Glan Conwy Trunk Road (A470) (Connecting Roads) (Dowlais Top to Hirwaun) (Side Roads) Order 201-	Orders under s.10, s.14, s.16 or s.28 of the Highways Act 1980	Highways Act 1980
Neath to Abergavenny Trunk Road (A465) (Abergavenny to Hirwaun Dualling and Slip Roads) and East of Abercynon to East of Dowlais Trunk Road (A4060) and Cardiff to Glan Conwy Trunk Road (A470) (Connecting Roads) (Gilwern to Brynmawr) Side Roads)	Orders under s.10, s.14, s.16 or s.28 of the Highways Act 1980	Highways Act 1980

<p>M4 Corridor around Newport</p> <p>The M4 Motorway (Junction 23 (East of Magor) to West of Junction 29 (Castleton) and Connecting Roads) and the M48 Motorway (Junction 23 (East of Magor) Connecting Road) (Amendment) Scheme 201-</p>	<p>Orders under s.10, s.14, s.16 or s.28 of the Highways Act 1980</p>	<p>Highways Act 1980</p>
<p>M4 Corridor around Newport</p> <p>The M4 Motorway (Junction 23 (East of Magor) to West of Junction 29 (Castleton) and Connecting Roads) and the M48 Motorway (Junction 23 (East of Magor) Connecting Road) and the London to Fishguard Trunk Road (East of Magor to Castleton) (Side Roads) Order 201-</p>	<p>Orders under s.10, s.14, s.16 or s.28 of the Highways Act 1980</p>	<p>Highways Act 1980</p>

<p>M4 Corridor around Newport</p> <p>M4 Motorway (Junction 23 (East of Magor) to West of Junction 29 (Castleton) and Connecting Roads) and the M48 motorway (Junction 23 (East of Magor) connecting road) and the London to Fishguard Trunk Road (East of Magor to Castleton) Compulsory Purchase Order 201-</p>	<p>Orders under s.10, s.14, s.16 or s.28 of the Highways Act 1980</p>	<p>Highways Act 1980</p>
<p>M4 Corridor around Newport</p> <p>London to Fishguard Trunk Road (East of Magor to Castleton)</p>	<p>Orders under s.10, s.14, s.16 or s.28 of the Highways Act 1980</p>	<p>Highways Act 1980</p>
<p>M4 Corridor around Newport</p> <p>The M4 motorway (West of Magor to East of Castleton) and the A48 (M) Motorway (West of Castleton to St Mellons) (Variation of Various Schemes) Scheme 201-</p>	<p>Orders under s.10, s.14, s.16 or s.28 of the Highways Act 1980</p>	<p>Highways Act 1980</p>

The Fishguard to Bangor Trunk Road (A487) (Caernarfon and Bontnewydd Bypass and De-Trunking)	Orders under s.10, s.14, s.16 or s.28 of the Highways Act 1980	Highways Act 1980
The A4810 steelworks Access Road (Queen's Way) Order 2021.	Orders under s.10, s.14, s.16 or s.28 of the Highways Act 1980	Highways Act 1980
Wrexham Energy Centre	Development Consent Orders under s.31 of the Planning Act 2008;	DNS
Internal Power Generation Enhancement for Port Talbot Steelworks	Development Consent Orders under s.31 of the Planning Act 2008;	DNS
Hirwaun Power Station	Development Consent Orders under s.31 of the Planning Act 2008;	DNS
Abergelli Power Powerstation	Development Consent Orders under s.31 of the Planning Act 2008;	DNS
Swansea Bay Tidal Lagoon	Development Consent Orders under s.31 of the Planning Act 2008;	Electricity Act 1989
Mynydd y Gwynt Windfarm	Development Consent Orders under s.31 of the Planning Act 2008;	DNS
Brechfa Forest Connection	Development Consent Orders under s.31 of the Planning Act 2008;	DNS
North Wales Wind Farm Connections	Development Consent Orders under s.31 of the Planning Act 2008;	DNS

Wentlooge Solar	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Morlais Demonstration Zone	Orders under s.1 and s.3 of the Transport and Works Act 1992;	TWA Order under s.1 or s.3 of the Transport and Works Act 1992.
Erebus - Floating Offshore Wind Demonstration Project.	Consents to construct and operate generating stations under s.36 of the Electricity Act 1989	Electricity Act 1989
Rush Wall Solar Park Ltd	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
EDF Energy Renewables Ltd. Garn Fach, South of Newtown Powys. - DNS/3244499	Developments of National Significance permission under s.62D of the Town and Country Planning Act	DNS
Biomass fuelled generation station at Penrhos Works, Holyhead, Anglesey	Consents to construct and operate generating stations under s.36 of the Electricity Act 1989	DNS
Port of Swansea - Tidal Lagoon Harbour Revision Order	Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under s.14 of the Harbours Act 1964.	Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under s.14 of the Harbours Act 1964.

Neath Harbour Order	Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under s.14 of the Harbours Act 1964.	Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under s.14 of the Harbours Act 1964.
Milford Haven (Martello Quays) Harbour Revision Order	Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under s.14 of the Harbours Act 1964.	Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under s.14 of the Harbours Act 1964.
Fishguard Linkspan Harbour Revision Order	Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under s.14 of the Harbours Act 1964.	Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under s.14 of the Harbours Act 1964.
Holyhead Harbour Revision Order.	Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under s.14 of the Harbours Act 1964.	Harbour Revision and Empowerment Orders under s.14 of the Harbours Act 1964.